To Accreditation Council of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care 05.05.2022

# REPORT

# OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF EVALUATION OF THE BACHELOR'S DEGREE PROGRAMME "GENERAL MEDICINE" OF THE NEI "KAZAKHSTAN-RUSSIAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME IN THE SPECIALTY "GENERAL MEDICINE" IN MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS

external expert evaluation period: 18-20 April 2022

Almaty, 2022

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2	
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3	
2.	General part of the final report	4	
2.1.	Presentation of the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine"		
	NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"		
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	5	
2.3.	Conclusion on the results of the report analysis on the self-assessment of the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine" of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of the bachelor's degree programme and conclusions	6	
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	8	
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and students	16	
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of the external assessment of the bachelor's degree programme "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"	19	
6.	Recommendations for improving the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine"	58	
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	59	
	Attachment 1. Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine	60	
	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	61	

Abbreviation	List of symbols and abbreviations Designation
PBL	6
	Problem-based learning
TBL	Team -based learning
SIQS	Swiss Institute of Quality Standards
AC	Academic Council
BD	Basic disciplines
University	Higher education institution
EEC	External expert commission
SAC	State Attestation Commission
SCES	State compulsory standard of education
UNT	Unified national testing
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
IEP	Individual Educational Plan
CEP	Education Programmes Committee
KRMU	Kazakhstan - Russian Medical University
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RoK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
NJSC	Non-profit joint-stock company
IAAR	Independent agency for accreditation and rating
RW	Research work
NLA	Normative legal acts
NPI (NI)	Non-profit institution
NEI	Non-State educational institution
MC	Medical Center
GMP	General Medical Practice
GM	General Medicine
GED	General educational disciplines
EP	Educational programme
OSCE	Objective Structured Clinical Exam
PD	Profiling Disciplines
MMC	Mobile Medical Complex
РНС	Primary health care
TS	Teaching staff
WC	Work Curriculum
QMS	Quality Management System
CYS	Council of Young Scientists
SSS	Student Scientific Society
IWS	Independent work of the student (resident)
IWRT	Resident independent work under the supervision of a teacher
TEP	Typical educational plan
TCC	Training and Clinical Center
EMCD	Educational and methodological complex of the discipline
SC	Scientific Council

# List of symbols and abbreviations

# 1. Composition of the external expert commission

In accordance with the ECAQA Order No. 12 dated April 4, 2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine" in the period April 18-20, 2022, as follows:

order №	Status as part of EEC	Full name	Science degree, honorary title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	chairperson	Turgunov Ermek Meiramovich	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical Diseases of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda", member of the International Society of Surgeons, "Association of Independent Experts of Astana".
2	Foreign Expert	Ubaidullaeva Sevara Abdullaevna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Quality Control Department of the Tashkent Pediatric Medical University, The Republic of Uzbekistan, "Mehr-Sakhovat" badge, Order of the 2nd degree "Salomatlik"
3	Academic Expert	Mustafina Kamila Kamalovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Microbiology, Virology and Immunology of Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University
4	Expert Employer	Shamsutdinova Alfia Gumarovna	MD, MSc, BA, Fogarty Fellow, Director of the Children's Medical Center "Helmir Kids", President of the Association of Bioethics and Medical Law, Doctor of the highest category in Public Health Care
5	Student	Kadyrova Ainur Adiletovna	Student of the fifth year of study in the specialty "General Medicine». NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University"

The ECAQA observer is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation of EEC (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The ECAQA report contains an assessment of the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of the bachelor's degree programme in General Medicine of medical education organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the ECAQA for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

# 2. General part of the final report

# 2.1 Presentation of the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine" of NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-governmental educational institution "Kazakhstan - Russian Medical University", 970 240 002 300	
Management body	The supreme body – the general meeting of participants	
	Executive body – Rector	
	Control body – Audit Commission	
	Collegiate body – Academic Council	
Full name of the chief executive officer	Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich	
Created in	1992 у.	
Location and contact details	71, Torekulova str., Almaty	
State license for educational	license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued by	
activities in the bachelor's degree	the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and	
(date, number)	Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the	
	Republic of Kazakhstan on June 2, 2010	
Information on branches,	no.	
subsidiaries (if any)		
Year of implementation of the		
accredited bachelor's degree	2014	
programme (EP)		
Duration of training	7 years (5 years Bachelor's + 2 years Internship)	
Total number of graduates since the beginning of EP implementation	1662 (2014-2021гг.)	
Number of students in EP since the	3467 (bachelors) + 634 (internship)	
beginning of the current year	Total 4101	
Full-time trainers/	Total: 704	
Combiners involved in the		
implementation of EP, incl. % of	Full-time employees with scientific degrees: 293 people /	
degree	41.6%	
	Employees: 256 persons / 36 %	

The NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" (hereinafter – the University) was established in 1992 as the Kazakhstan Medical Institute (KMI). In 2010, KMI was renamed into Kazakhstan - Russian Medical University (certificate of state re-registration No. 9833-1910-U-e dated May 4, 2010).

The University currently represents the organization of medical education with a private form of ownership, having the necessary material, technical and scientific and educational base, highly qualified pedagogical and scientific personnel (license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 2, 2010). The University trains specialists in the following levels: bachelor's degree, internship, residency and master's degree on the basis of existing state licenses for higher and postgraduate levels, additional education in accordance with the current State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and also implements additional education Programmes.

On the basis of the order of the acting chairperson of the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 15, 2018 No.264, the direction of the master's degree in EP 6M110100 "Medicine" (license No. 0137388) and 6M110200 "Public Health Care" (license No. 0162831) was opened at the NEI "Kazakhstan - Russian Medical University".

The university's budget is formed from several sources: the republican budget (a state order for the training of specialists of higher, postgraduate and additional education), the provision of paid educational services.

The financing of the university is stable and contributes to improving the material and technical base and increasing the contingent.

The main applied scientific direction of the university is the development of innovations for implementation in practical health care, including the development of mobile medicine for the rural population. Thus, for his achievements in the development of mobile medical complexes, Rector, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor N.T. Dzhainakbayev was awarded the quality certificate of the Swiss Institute of Quality Standard "International Quality Certificate" (SIQS) on July 1, 2015.

Since 2011, the University publishes a quarterly magazine «Actual problem of theoretical and clinical medicine».

In order to develop cooperation, 30 agreements, agreements and memoranda with Kazakhstan and foreign higher educational institutions have been concluded.

In 2012, the University successfully passed the State Attestation of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, in 2018 and 2020 – preventive control of the Committee for ensuring control in the field of education and science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Training of students is conducted in the state, Russian and English languages. Form of study – full-time, daytime. Over 29 years of activity, the University has trained more than 6,000 specialists successfully working in the practical health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Mission and Vision are available on the university's official website, which have been previously discussed and agreed with stakeholders (teachers, employees, employees) <u>http://medkrmu.kz/missiya-universiteta/</u>.

The University has its Organizational Structure approved by the Rector's Order (No. 26-02-07-n/k dated 16.07.2020).

University management is implemented through collegial bodies: the Scientific Council (SC), the Academic Council, the Scientific and Clinical Council, the Local Ethics Commission, the Coordination Council for Quality and Strategic Development, the Council of Young Scientists and the Student Scientific Society.

The University develops its activities through the Strategic Development Plan of the NEI "Kazakhstan - Russian Medical University" (long-term) (http://medkrmu.kz/strategicheskie-plany-razvitiya/) and the Tactical Plan for the implementation of the strategy (academic year), which are discussed and approved at the meeting of the Academic Council of the University with the participation of stakeholders.

In accordance with Article 23 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Science", the University was accredited by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan as a subject of scientific and scientific-technical activity, certificate number Series MK No. 005269 dated 08.10.2018.

#### **2.2. Information on previous accreditation**

In 2016, the University was accredited by the Independent Kazakhstan Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (certificate of institutional accreditation dated May 31, 2016 IANo.0066, valid from May 31, 2016 to June 01, 2021). Also in 2021, the University was accredited by the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care" (certificate of international institutional accreditation dated June 17, 2021 IA00039, valid from June 17, 2021 to June 16, 2026).

Specialized accreditation passed 6 educational Programmes of bachelor's degree, 13 educational Programmes of residence in the Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency (IAAR) http://www.iaar.kz/en/accreditation-en/perechen-akkreditovannykh-obrazovatelnykh-

programm/respublika-kazakhstan/meditsinskie-organizatsii-obrazovaniya# and 2 educational

Programmes of master's degree <u>http://www.ecaqa.org/akkreditatsiya/reestr-akkreditovannykh-meditsinskikh-organizatsij-obrazovaniya-i-obrazovatelnykh-programm/spetsializirovannaya-akkreditatsiya/magistratura</u>

Accreditation of the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine" IAAR No.1071 dated 03.10.2016 is valid until 02.10.2021.

# 2.3 Conclusion on the results of the analysis of the report on the self-assessment of the Bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of the educational Programme of the Bachelor of Medical Education Organizations and conclusions

A self-assessment report of the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 125 pages of the main text, 119-page appendices, copies or electronic versions of 72 documents located at <u>https://drive.google.com/drive/u/0/folders/</u>.

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the Head of the KRMU Rector, Dr. med., Professor Nurlan Temirbekovich Dzhainakbayev, which confirms the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of the internal self-assessment commission members with an indication of the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme – Bekmagambetov Zh.M., Head of the Department of Strategic Development and Accreditation

The self-assessment of the bachelor's degree programme 6B10103 "General Medicine" of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" was carried out on the basis of order No. 26-02-50-n/k dated 01.07.2021. "On preparation for accreditation and organization of the process of self-assessment of bachelor's degree programme".

All EEC members have conducted a preliminary review of the self-assessment report of the educational programme in the specialty of "General Medicine" of KRMU and questions from them and/or requests for additional information and documents were forwarded to the university through a representative of the accreditation body (ECAQA).

All 9 standards provide real practice and detailed description of the current practice of the NEI "Kazakhstan - Russian Medical University" for the preparation of bachelors and interns in the specialty "General Medicine", taking into account the beginning of admission of students in 2015 y. analytical data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the Educational Programme, national and international events, methodological support of the educational process, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the conclusions of the self-assessment of the educational programme for each accreditation standard are clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, tables and contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

# 3. Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion

External expert work as part of the accreditation and external evaluation of the educational programme "General Medicine" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and bachelor's degree programme of ECAQA (approved by the Expert Board and the order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care" No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the Programme approved on April 4, 2022 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the KRMU Rector Dzhainakbayev N.T. Dates of the visit to the educational organization: April 18-20, 2022.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center and in Attachment 3 to this report. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- examining and analyzing the self-assessment report of the educational programme and requesting additional information and documents;
- review of documents and data during the visit and external evaluation;
- interview with management and administrative staff during meetings and visits to the university 24 people;
- interviews with students 47 people;
- the website survey <u>https://krmu.edu.kz/;</u>
- interviewing 28 teachers;
- questionnaires of teachers and students 200 and 200, respectively;
- Supervising student learning: attendance at 5 practical classes: ("BLS" basic cardiopulmonary resuscitation), teacher: Kondyzbaeva M.M., students of the 6th year, UCP; "Lymphatic system", teacher: Erementaeva Zh.M., students of the 1st year, Department of Anatomy; "Pathological anatomy of leukemias" teacher Esirgepova S.R., students of the 3rd year, Department of Pathological Anatomy and Forensic Medicine, "Heart defects", teacher Nugmanova A.M., students of the 4th year, Department of Pediatrics with a course of children's infectious diseases; "Chronic hepatitis", teacher Ligai Z.N., students of the 6th year Department of General Medical Practice).
- review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards: 2 practice/clinical engagement bases were visited, including Children's City Clinical Hospital No.2 and City Polyclinic No.8, where training under the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine" is conducted with the participation of 5 full-time teachers and 3 part-time employees;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 72 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in Attachment 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interviews and appointments (table in Attachment 3).

Thus, when implementing the activities of the Programme, namely, based on the results of the interview with the first head of the organization, members of the advisory body (academic council, Committee of Educational Programmes), in interviews with students and teachers, compliance with the criteria of standard 1 was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the organization, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations. The development strategy of the NEI "KRMU" for 2019-2025 was reviewed (approved by the rector on December 26, 2019), which includes such areas as: improving the quality of services through the development of the university's educational Programmes; internationalization and development of the university's scientific potential at the international and national levels; ensuring the growth of the university's management efficiency through digitalization of activities and compliance with the requirements of national and international standards; improving the efficiency of human capital management through improving the processes of relationship management, developing competencies, team spirit and proactivity; forming the university's image in the education market through the use of marketing tools; modernizing the material and technical base of the university through the updating of computer equipment and increasing the classroom fund, which confirms the fulfillment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization.

From interviews with residents, it was established that before the beginning of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the organization of education, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases. This indicates compliance with **Standard 2** in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

The organization's documents contain work programmes, EMCD, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work. Compliance with the SCES and standard requirements has been established. Attending the practical lesson on the topic "Lymphatic system", the volume of hours -2, experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to the plan, the TBL (3 small groups work with electronic atlases of anatomy) and PBL (discussion of problematic issues on the topic of the lesson) technologies are used, during the lesson students respond to tests in the form of "silent drawings", receive feedback from the teacher, have the opportunity to improve the skill in the knowledge of the anatomy of internal organs.

When attending a practical lesson on "Pathological anatomy in leukemias" of 2 hours, the members\_of the EEC made sure that the use of TBL technologies in the bachelor's degree is systemic in nature (3 subgroups with subsequent discussion of each clinical case), the time interval of the lesson is carried out, strict observance of the lesson plan, students are provided with the necessary resources – microscopes, micro and macro preparations, projection equipment. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, since the experts studied the Code of Corporate Culture and Ethics (approved at the meeting of the Constitutional Court No.4 of 26.11.2021) and during the interview the residents replied that they were informed about the content of this document.

When attending a practical lesson on the topic of "BLS" (basic life support), <u>a volume of 4 hours</u> and a conversation with students, experts saw that the organization contributes to the development of practical competencies of future bachelors (and interns), including simulation equipment at the training and clinical center. At the same time, students form and deepen their theoretical knowledge, develop communication skills.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advisory disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of the EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in classes.

A study of control and measurement tools (100 tests, 350 tasks, evaluation sheets (duty, MiniCEX, clinical case, presentation°, 360 feedback, practical skill -DOPS) showed that the

organization has implemented an appropriate evaluation policy that allows a multifaceted assessment of the educational achievements of residents. During the interview, the residents told about the assessment forms, for example, assessment sheets of practical skills, clinical case, tests and that they were satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of appealing the results of the assessment is reflected in the document "Academic Policy" (approved at the meeting of the Court of Justice No.1 of 28.08.2021). Thus, compliance with **standard 3 has been established.** 

During the visit to the organization and during the interview with the head of the department of general medical practice Ligai ZN, the commission made sure that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes such documents as annual operating plans, annual reports, regulations of divisions, job descriptions, academic policy, code of honor of teachers, and educational and methodological documentation (work Programme, work curricula, syllabuses, electronic journal), evaluation tools (checklists, sheets), certificates and certificates. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the necessary documents for residents – syllabuses, MOODLE platform, academic calendar, class schedule, list of groups, internal rules and there is information on academic policy, academic integrity, educational and social work, anti-corruption department, service support, which is regularly updated. This information was obtained during an interview with the head of the registrar's office, G.B. Kaliyeva.

The conversation with M.K. Iskakova, Dean of the Bachelor's Degree and Kh.K. Abdukarimov, Dean of the Internship, included such issues as admission rules, requirements for teachers, maintaining the level of pedagogical competence of teaching staff, using the capabilities of clinical bases, and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching (45\_people in total), about the strategy and tactics of recruitment to the internship, the information security of the educational Programme, as well as to identify problems in the management and development of human resources.

Interviews with 12 teachers, including 8 full-time teachers, showed that there are both successes and problems in educational management, depending on the specific base (admission of residents to the equipment, sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work). Experts received answers about the Programme of professional development of teachers, financing of this training, availability at teachers of certification on methods of teaching.

On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers and established compliance with **standard 4**.

In order to verify the data of **Standard 5**, external experts received an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with students, the implementation of an advisor system (a total of 6 advisors under the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine"), tutoring (a total of 12 people). Experts found that students are not sufficiently aware of the nature of the activities of tutors and identify it with the activities of tutors.

Teachers initiate research topics for students within scientific student circles, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, medical documentation, simulators and other simulation equipment.

In total, 101 clinical bases are used in the educational process at the university, 8 of them for the training and production practices of students of the 3rd, 4th, 5th courses of GM: SPE on the REM of the CCH No. 1 of Almaty; SPE on the REM of the CCH No. 4 of Almaty; SPE on the REM CCCH No. 2 of Almaty; SPE on the REM CCH of the city of Almaty; SPE on the REM "Hospital of emergency medical care" of the city of Almaty; SPE on the REM perinatal center of Almaty; SPE on the REM city perinatal center of Almaty; SPE on the REM perinatal center of Almaty; SPE on the REM context perinatal center of Almaty; SPE on the REM perinatal center of Almaty; SPE on the REM city perinatal center of Almaty; SPE on the REM perinatal center of Almaty; SPE on REM context perinatal center of Almaty; SPE on the REM perinatal center of Almaty; SPE on REM context perinatal center of Almaty; SPE on the REM perinatal center of Almaty; SPE on REM context perinatal center of Alm

Almaty; SPE on REM "City Polyclinic No. 3" in Almaty; SPE on REM "City Polyclinic No. 3" in Almaty.

During visits to clinical bases, where experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training Programmes, accessibility for teachers and students, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health care. On the bases there are training rooms, they are equipped with study desks, chairs, boards, cabinets, office equipment, rooms for practical skills, there are also conference halls where morning conferences and clinical debriefings with the participation of interns are held. Clinical departments, modern diagnostic equipment, auxiliary units of the clinical base allow you to accommodate undergraduate and intern students, effectively use material, technical and clinical opportunities for training.

Experts obtained evidence of compliance with **Standard 6**, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence on the quality of the Programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty. Experts asked questions about the satisfaction with the training, the adequacy of time for the supervision of patients, work with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and the qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for students in need, participation in scientific work, the availability of a resource of international databases of professional literature. In general, students are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, since they believe that the organization of education has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time, students would like to participate more often in international conferences, academic mobility, get more autonomy in patient management, in clinical disciplines.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering the questions of external experts, demonstrated their judgment in the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in R&D. Experts studied students' documents (portfolio, student assessment results, survey results).

Interviews with 10 employers were conducted online and included such issues as: knowledge of the mission of the university, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of students, participation in the training of students through mentoring and/or mentoring, providing the department and students with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments, the share of employment of graduates on completion of internship, etc. EEC experts found that employers take part in the work of advisory bodies, but not actively enough in the formulation of the mission and the development of the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine", emphasis is placed on training in internship and residency. At the same time, it is established that there are no problems with the employment of graduates of KRMU, the percentage of employment is in 2021 - 89.2%.

The review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, the clinical bases of Children's City Clinical Hospital No.2 with a total bed capacity of 280 beds (240 – inpatient and 40-day inpatient) and City Polyclinic No.8 with an attached population of 59,088 people, which has 4 therapeutic, 4 pediatric, 27 GPD sites. The employees of the organization of education provide collegial and ethical relations with medical personnel, the management of clinical bases to achieve the final results of students.

A sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students are provided, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and mentors (mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during the training.

The members of the commission received data on a highly professional staff of clinical departments with a high level of degree – more than 60% and significant clinical experience.

In total, 141 students with a master's degree, 200 candidates of sciences and PhD, 68 doctors of sciences, 29 teachers have the title of professor and 57 – associate professor, 3 members of the National Academy of Sciences.

The staff of the department prepared the content of the classes and uploaded it to Moodle (assignments for classes, IWRT, IWS, information blocks, videos). Special mention should be made of the activities of the professional video studio at the university, where video lectures of teaching staff are recorded at the modern level. These images are available on the MOODLE platform to residents from their personal account using their login and password. Also noteworthy is the work of mobile medical complexes to provide various medical services to the population within the framework of charitable events, while the scientific work of the teaching staff and students is carried out, teamwork skills and clinical competence of residents are improved.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. The experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the bachelor's degree programme "General medicine" for Compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed, and the chairperson of Turgunov E.M. held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council on the accreditation period -5 years.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the NEI "KRMU", the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization of education announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

**Conclusion:** At the stage before the visit to the university, the members of the EEC analyzed the "Self-Assessment Report of the KRMU" with annexes and documents posted on googledisk, prepared a list of additional documents and questions for clarification and verification of the submitted data, to which comprehensive data and answers were received during the visit.

Within the framework of the visit and external assessment of the NEI "KRMU" for compliance with the standards of specialized accreditation of organizations of additional education, the members of the EEC studied and evaluated the main indicators of the organization's activities. The article analyzes information obtained during visits to KRMU divisions and clinical bases, observation of processes, interviews with management, teaching staff, students, graduates of higher education institutions of different years and employers and study of relevant documents, evaluation of the results of questionnaires of students and teachers. The data obtained during the visit were compared with the data presented in the self-assessment report, which made it possible to verify the reliability of the information provided.

In general, EEC experts noted the high level of qualification of teachers, the motivation of students, the commitment of employees and students to the traditions and values of the university, the high social responsibility of teachers (teaching staff) and students, significant assistance to practical health care during the COVID-19 pandemic and in emergency situations, a high level of informatization and digitalization of processes, the provision of clinical bases at all levels of education. Clinical bases are specialized departments of various profiles with highly qualified personnel, which allows to ensure the quality of training in the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine". Academic buildings of the university, where theoretical departments, educational and clinical center, auxiliary units are based, are well equipped with modern equipment, have sufficient area. At the same time, members of the commission identified a number of points for improving the educational processes.

Thus, the external evaluation and the visit of the members of the EEC allowed to verify the data of the report on the self-assessment of the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine" in full in accordance with the Regulations on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external evaluation of the medical organization of education of the ECAQA and to formulate recommendations for improving the system of training medical personnel through the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine".

#### 4. **Results of the survey.**

The ECAQA observer conducted an online questionnaire on February 17-18, 2022 at https://webanketa.com/.

# The survey of students includes 21 questions.

A total of 200 people responded to the student questionnaire (in total 3530 students for the current year) answered.

As part of the accreditation of the "General Medicine" during the visit of the external expert commission, students and interns were surveyed.

The first question showed that from 200 respondents 42% are students of the 2nd year and 28% - students of the 3rd year, first-year students -17%, seniors (5-7 years of study) made 11%.

The vast majority of respondents, 53.5%, would recommend studying at KRMU to their environment, 36% partially agreed with this statement, only 2.5% will not recommend this university and 8% found it difficult to give an answer.

When asked whether a student participates in the work of advisory bodies (academic council, academic council, Committees of Educational Programmes), 30% answered in the affirmative, 47.5% wrote that they were not involved in advisory bodies, 22.5% answered "I do not know anything about it".

The assessment of satisfaction with the conditions for training and the equipment of training rooms and classrooms of the KRMU showed that 49.5% were completely satisfied with the provided conditions, 33.5%) were partially satisfied, 4% were not completely satisfied, 8% chose the answers "partially dissatisfied" and 5% - "doubtful with the answer".

The overwhelming majority also answered positively to the question whether the conditions for rest and meals for students (recreation rooms, benches/gazebos on the territory, canteen) were created in this educational organization - 56%, 10% partially agreed and 9% completely disagreed with this statement, and 17.5% partially disagreed, 7.5% doubted the answer.

The equipment and facilities of the classrooms at the clinical bases fully satisfy 58%, partially - 23.5%, does not fully satisfy 7% and doubted the answer 11%.

64,5% consider that teachers regularly provide pupils with methodical materials, additional literature for preparation for classes, 24,5% - not always, 7% - seldom, 4% doubted with the answer.

Of those surveyed, 23.5 per cent are engaged in R&D, another 36.5 per cent plan to engage, 32 per cent are not engaged and 8 per cent do not wish to do so.

The majority of residents were fully satisfied with the resources of the library fund, which is 77%. Insufficiently necessary textbooks were noted by 9%, and 8.5% do not use the library, without an answer to this question -5.5%

72.5% noted that teachers and employees of the organization of education respect students. 13.5% disagree with this statement, 14% of respondents did not have an answer.

74.5 agree with the statement that social Programmes to support students exist and are implemented in the organization of education. 1.5% disagree, 15.5% did not hear about such Programmes, 5% answered "what is it?" and 3.5% did not respond.

When asked that the tutor helps in training 48% of respondents answered that constantly, 18% - sometimes, 9,5% - at my request, 5.5% answered – seldom, thus 19% don't know the tutor.

Question in the questionnaire that independent work of the student is necessary part of study in higher education, 66% completely agreed, partially agreed -20,5%, disagree completely 4%, disagree partially 5,5% and doubted with the answer 4%.

48% rated the organization of clinical (practical) training as "excellent", 23% "good", 17% could not assess, 7% answered "satisfactory", 5% - unsatisfactory.

To the question whether there is sufficient time for practical training (patient care, clinical rounds, clinical reviews, assistance in operations, work in laboratories) 49% gave the answer "agree completely", 19% "agree partially", 15.5% "DO not agree completely", 4% do not agree partially, doubted the answer - 12.5%.

61.5% noted that after graduation the teacher constantly gives feedback (listens to the opinion, carries out a mini-questionnaire, works on mistakes), 22% answered that sometimes, 6.5% – rarely, 7% - never, 3% did not know what to answer.

On a question of the questionnaire "The teacher (mentor, curator) of this organization of education is for me an example as the professional doctor, the person (ethics, communications, appearance, speech)" completely agree 64,5% of respondents, 4,5% of students completely disagree, not all teachers of this organization of education noted 21%, 10% doubted with the answer.

65.5% of students noted that they like to study in this educational institution, 24.5% partially agree with this, 3% completely disagree and 3% partially disagree with this statement and 4% did not have an opinion.

65% fully agree that the assessment of knowledge and skills is carried out fairly and correctly, another 27% partially agreed with this, 5% remained dissatisfied and 3% doubted the answer.

When asked the questionnaire, "Do you think this educational organization allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the specialty you have chosen?", 71.5% answered "yes, I am sure of it", 5% of the surveyed students are not sure of it, 13% answered "I cannot answer this question yet", 6% answered "I would like to believe it" and 4.5% of the respondents answered "I am beginning to doubt it".

On the question of the questionnaire, "Did managers and/or teachers involve you in activities to prepare for institutional or specialized (Programme) accreditation?" 33.5% answered "yes, when preparing the self-assessment report", 9.5% answered "yes, for the organization of a meeting of external experts", 3.5% – "yes, at all stages of preparation", 0.5%– "yes, since I speak a foreign language", 5% refused to participate for a good reason, 35% answered "no" and 13% noted in the questionnaire that they first heard about accreditation when the commission arrived.

The teacher survey included 26 questionnaire questions. In total 200 people (in total in the staff 655) answered, thus pedagogical experience till 5 years – at 35,5%, till 10 years - 15%, more than 10 years – 49,5%.

Of the 200 teachers surveyed, the profile of the specialty is therapeutic - 22%, pediatric - 36.5%, surgical - 10%, obstetrics and gynecology - 8%, functional diagnostics - 4.5%, another profile - 19%.

90.5% are completely satisfied with the organization of the educational process in this HEI, 9% are partially satisfied, 0.5% are partially dissatisfied.

91% noted that in this organization of education ethics and subordination in the relations between colleagues, teachers, the management are observed, 8,5% - agreed partially, 0,5% partially disagree with it.

Completely satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace in this organization of education - 91.5% and partially agree - 8.5% of respondents.

70.8% of respondents noted that there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies in the organization, 22.1% partially agree, 2.6% partially agree, 1.8% completely disagree.

86% of respondents fully agree that they have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results in this educational organization, 14% partially agree.

The salary is fully satisfied with 90% of the respondents, more Yes than no - 9.5%, no answer at 0.5%.

Satisfied with the work of the HR service (personnel)- fully -89%, partially - 10%, partially not satisfied - 0.5% and the same – doubt the answer.

In less than 1 year, 51.5 per cent of 39 per cent of the respondents had completed vocational training courses (programmes); more than 3 years ago, 6 per cent; more than 5 years ago, 2.5 per cent; and 1 per cent of the respondents had no answer.

In this organization of education have an opportunity to realize as the professional in a specialty completely -90,5%, partially agree -9,5%.

98% of respondents note the timeliness of fulfilling requests for the purchase of methodological and didactic materials, office equipment, stationery to ensure the educational process in the organization, have nothing to do with this - 2%.

They noted that the organization of education supports the participation of teaching staff in conferences (international, republican)- payment of travel, travel expenses, registration fee - 80% of teaching staff, payment of travel only - 9.5%, payment of registration fee only -4%, I am for self-financing of participation -1%, did not contact the management on this matter - 3%, there is no answer from 1.5% of respondents.

Fully agree that students have free access to patients at the clinical bases of the university to improve their practical skills - 90% of teaching staff, partially agree -9%, doubt the answer- 1%.

On the question "Are social support programmes for teachers implemented in the HEIs?" answered: yes, there are such Programmes 95%, yes, I have already used it - 4%, I do not know about it - 1%

86.5% of respondents answered that yes, the heads of the organization systematically listen to their opinion regarding questions on the educational process, research, clinical work, yes, sometimes 11% noted, quite rarely - 1%, 1.5% have no answer.

To the question: What teaching methods do you most often use in the process of teaching students (bachelors, residents, undergraduates) Teaching staff noted that Lectures are used -44%, Oral analysis of the topic of the lesson - 59%, Rewriting of thematic information from monographs - 9.5%, Problem-oriented learning- 58.5%, Interactive learning- 31.5%, Completion of abstracts - 19.5%, Practical classes on clinical skills in the training and clinical center- 46%, Analysis of situational tasks -33%, Preparation and solution of cases - 58%, Oral survey of students - 64%, Solution of tests - 65%, Work in small groups - 34%, Written assignments - 13.5%

We fully agree that this questionnaire is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of the organization 89.5% of the teaching staff, partially agree -9.5%, partially disagree -0.5%, I find it difficult to answer -0.5%.

The microclimate in the team 88.5% of respondents characterized as satisfactory, do not pay attention to it 2%, quite suits 9.5%.

88.5% fully agree with the statement that students of this HEI have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the curriculum, 11.5% partially agree.

To a question what materials it is necessary to have during carrying out classes with pupils 81% answered – cases, 89,5% - a syllabus and educational - a methodical complex of discipline, 78,5% - control - measuring instruments (tests, situational tasks), monographs specified 5,5\%, the educational journal - 75\%, the log of working off - 6%.

The question "The theoretical part of the training lesson in my capacity as a teacher of clinical discipline takes up to 30% of the total amount of time. 83% of respondents answered, 50% of the time -11.5% of the teaching staff indicated, about 70% of the time - only 3.5% of respondents.

The previous level of preparation of students when entering study Programmes in your organization of education fully satisfies 89% of the teaching staff, partially satisfies 11%.

The work of the mentor of residents is performed by 22%, the student's curator -71%, tutors -4.5%, they are not them -2.5%.

To the question "Is it difficult for you to combine teaching activities with clinical work in a hospital or polyclinic?" 84.5% answered that they have a well-established labor organization, 2.5% answered in the affirmative, 8.5% predominate in teaching activities, 4.5% predominate in clinical

work, these activities complement each other - 6.5%, I doubt with the answer - 1.5%, I do not do clinical work - 2.5%

The professional level is estimated as high 96.5% of faculty, as average - 2%, I find it difficult to answer - 1,5%.

The survey results generally demonstrate the positive aspects of undergraduate and internship Programmes, the satisfaction of both students and teachers with the educational process, the resources of clinical bases, the competencies of teachers, and also indicate the presence of centralized management of the educational Programme, at the same time identify areas for improvement - Programmes of social support for teachers, pedagogical competencies and professional development of teachers.

5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the Bachelor's degree programme "General medicine" of NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"

#### Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES <u>Evidence of compliance:</u> 1.1 Mission statement

1.1 Mission statement

The mission of the educational Programme is formulated taking into account the demands of practical health care, is presented in the educational programme. EEC experts confirmed that the information about the training mission is brought to the attention of the faculty at the meetings of the department, dean's office, Scientific Council (SC) and Academic Council (AC). The mission is brought to the attention of students at curatorial hours, meetings with deans, placed on the information stands of the university buildings, the official website of the university. The mission of the educational Programme (EP) is posted on the website of the university in the section of the Faculty of General Medicine <a href="https://krmu.edu.kz/fakultet-obshhaya-meditsina/">https://krmu.edu.kz/fakultet-obshhaya-meditsina/</a>.

The mission of the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine": the preparation of a comprehensively developed, competitive bachelor of health care, able to perform their professional activities qualitatively, having high social responsibility, able to learn throughout life and meet the needs and expectations of society.

The purpose of the educational Programme: training of health care professionals in the field of general medicine to provide qualified medical care to the population, taking into account the individual characteristics of patients, is also available on the website of the Faculty of Medicine <u>\_</u><u>https://krmu.edu.kz/fakultet-obshhaya-meditsina/.</u>

The educational Programme presents the final results, which are also available in syllabuses and are available to teachers and students through the university portal. Scorecards record the extent to which resident learning outcomes have been achieved. For the purposes of training, it is clearly stated that the graduate of the EP will have the following competencies: Leader, Professional, Scientist, Lifelong Learner.

It is established that the mission of the EP corresponds to the mission of the university and the development strategy of the university. At the same time, the strategy of the university was revised twice. In 2018, a commission for strategic planning and development was established (order No.208 dated September 5, 2018), the result of the commission's work was the development and approval of the Strategic Plan for 2017-2021 (Minutes No.5 of the Academic Council dated December 29, 2017). Currently, there is a modified strategic plan approved in the form of a document - "Strategy of the NEI" Kazakhstan - Russian Medical University" for 2019-2025" (Protocol No.5 of the US dated 26.12.2019).

This document contains "Direction 2. Development of the research potential of the university and the integration of science with the clinic", where the goals and objectives of the scientific activities of the teachers of the faculty "General Medicine", providing the educational process of the "General Medicine", integrated with the modern achievements of science and practice for the training of competitive, demanded in the international labor market specialists are established and implemented.

The interaction between teaching, research and training is one of the main principles of the University, which is reflected in the Quality Assurance Policy of the EP.

Teachers of "General Medicine" actively introduce into the content of lectures, practical classes, IWRT modern achievements of basic biomedical and clinical disciplines in the scientific field. This contributes to the formation of a close connection between the theoretical and practical application of scientific knowledge and skills in further professional activities.

In the process of revision of the GM bachelor's degree programme in 2019, the curriculum of the discipline "Microbiology" (2nd year) included topics on virology, which was initiated by the lecturer, lecturer PhD Bari A., who is the author of patents for useful models "Method of isolating viral particles from infected plant material by the express method" (2017), "Method of determining viral infection in plant tissues by the express method" (2019) and a scientific article "The influence of the virus suppressor on the activity of oxidative stress enzymes" at the III International Scientific and Practical Conference "Methodology, theory and practice of modern biology" in 2018 in Kostanay. The materials of these research studies were discussed with students during the IWRT.

The curriculum of the discipline "Traumatology" (4th year) included topics on pediatric traumatology at the initiative of the head of the department "General medicine" Dr. med. Duissenova N.B., known for his research in the field of treatment of epistemic fractures of the humerus in children, the article "Treatment of diaphyseal fractures of the hip in children" was published in the journal of the KRMU "Actual problems of clinical and theoretical medicine", together with students in 2018.

Separately, the EEC experts noted the projects of the KRMU, which influenced the development of the mission and content of the EP related to the mobile medical complex (MMC), in particular the hemodialysis center, which has no analogues in the world, created in cooperation with Fresenius Medical Care and the Asar-Bereke Foundation. This MMC is equipped with state-of-the-art equipment for the procedure of extrarenal blood purification. Students of the GP "General Medicine" receive practical skills in various types of MMC: diagnostic; outpatient-polyclinic; surgical; emergency rescue; hemodialysis; high-throughput MMC; mobile paramedical and obstetric station.

According to ESG standards, the elements of the internal quality assurance system are reflected in the following documents: Quality Policy, University Academic Policy, University Admission Rules, passport of the GM bachelor's degree programme, Code of Corporate Culture and Ethics. The faculty makes proposals to improve the quality assurance policy of the EP. The collection and analysis of proposals and comments from the faculty is carried out by the head of the department and submits the results for discussion by the academic quality council of the faculty. The board includes employees involved in the quality assurance process of the Programme, representatives of employers and students who participate in the discussion of the proposed improvements to the EP quality assurance policy.

External monitoring is carried out during the work of external examiners involved in the admission of examinations, certification commission, external assessment of educational achievements, under the state control by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, by participating in the annual ratings of NCE "Atameken", etc., as well as passing institutional and specialized accreditation of the EP.

The interaction between teaching, research and training is one of the main principles of the University, which is reflected in the Quality Assurance Policy of the EP.

## 1.2 Participation in the formulation of the mission of the bachelor's degree programme

When studying the available materials, the members of the EEC established that when forming the mission and the final results of the EP, discussions were held at the level of the student audience, graduates, employees of the department, at departmental meetings, in the capacity of the Department of General Medical Practice (No.11 dated 26.06.2019, at the meeting of the CEP (No.11 dated 27.06.2019), at the Academic Council (No.6 dated 27.05.2019) and the Academic Council of the University (No.11 dated 24.07.2019).

From the interview with the administration of the university, faculty, residents and employers it was established that the formation of the mission and the final results of training is influenced by the

opinions of various stakeholders - heads of departments and divisions of the university, faculty, students, graduates, employers, health and education authorities, representatives of the public.

The project team for the development of the strategy and mission of the university, along with the teaching staff, includes employers and students (order No.96 of 17.04.2019).

The process of continuous quality assurance, as the main idea of the mission, includes annual revisions of the structure and content of the EP, analysis of the effectiveness of the Programmes, as well as mandatory involvement and participation of the main stakeholders. The grounds for the revision of the mission of the EP are the opinions of employers expressed at the meetings of the Council of the Faculty of General Medicine and the CEP, annual meetings on the revision of the EP or presented in the form of reviews on the EP; the opinion of students obtained during the analysis of the students' questionnaire, as well as expressed by students who are members of the Council of the Faculty of General Medicine; the opinion of teachers expressed at the methodological meetings of all departments serving the EP "General Medicine".

The General Medicine Faculty carries out the following stages of the life cycle of the educational Programme (EP): development and revision, including the mission and goals of the EP, based on the results of annual monitoring of the quality assurance system of the EP. Students are members of advisory bodies, such as the Committee of Educational Programmes. For example: A. Mokhirev, 5th year student of the specialty "General Medicine" (2019-2020 academic year); Oralbayev N. intern of the 6th year of the specialty "General Medicine" (2019-2020 academic year), were participants in the creation of the current educational Programme of the faculty. At present, due to the fact that the above students have completed their education, other representatives of the student environment. In addition to the students of the Faculty of General Medicine, representatives of practical health care have equal rights to participate in the creation of the educational Programme: Director of the City Cardiology Center of DHC Almaty A.Kodaspayev; Chief Doctor of the State Clinical Hospital No. 5 B. Sadykov. Proposals submitted orally or in writing from students and employers are discussed, taken into account and taken into account.

When uploaded to the Republican Register of Educational Programmes, it was reviewed and then adjusted with the participation of external reviewers.

Meetings with representatives of medical organizations are also held annually through the job fair, at which issues of the quality of graduates' training are discussed, proposals for improving the strategy and tactics of students' education are formed, which allows timely development of measures to eliminate shortcomings.

#### 1.3. Institutional autonomy and academic freedom

In the implementation of academic independence, the University relies on the following documents: Charter; Development Strategy; Internal Quality Assurance Policy; Academic Policy; Code of Academic Integrity; Rules for admission to the bachelor's degree Programme.

The EEC Commission established that the Academic Policy of the university defines the principles of institutional autonomy: bringing educational Programmes and curricula in line with ESG; ensuring academic mobility of students and teachers; forming an approach to education as a lifelong process; increasing the attractiveness of the university, the opportunity to be open to all regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan; expanding the boundaries of academic freedom of educational Programmes.

The autonomy of the KRMU consists of academic autonomy (making decisions on educational Programmes, methods and areas of study, disciplines, awarding degrees, goals and methods of scientific research), financial autonomy (obtaining and managing their funds, making decisions on students' tuition fees), organizational and personnel autonomy (creation of structural units, approval of positions, election of officials and governing bodies, determination of wages).

According to the normative-legal acts of education and medicine of KRMU academic freedom in drawing up educational Programmes is provided. The responsibility of the CEPs and structural units in drawing up the educational Programme is ensured by the procedure for reviewing and approving these

Programmes: the CEP, the AC and the SC, which is confirmed by the minutes of meetings at the relevant levels. During the development of the "General Medicine" Programme, employers are interviewed in order to prioritize the preliminary list of competencies of graduates and clarify the trajectories of training. The developed educational Programme is coordinated and reviewed by representatives of employers.

An example of the implementation of the university's autonomy is the anti-crisis plan for the development of higher education (07.08.2020), when measures were taken due to the COVID-19 pandemic: a system of mixed form of education was introduced with the transfer of some disciplines to a remote format; a change in the ratio of the cost of study and the cost of the grant was made; the requirement to ensure the employment of university graduates was specified; mandatory documents in the past were translated into electronic format and are not printed on paper.

An important indicator of the institutional autonomy of the KRMU is the right of the faculty to choose the procedures for quality control of education. The faculty, staff and students participate in the decision-making process on all academic and organizational issues, which is confirmed by experts when analyzing the composition of advisory bodies.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 17 standards: fully -16, partially -1, non-compliant -0

**Standard 1:** standard is fulfilled **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:** no

# Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME <u>Evidence of compliance:</u>

## 2.1 Outcomes of the Educational Programme (EP)

The bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine" is presented in Kazakh, Russian and English.

As a result of the analysis of the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine", it was established by the members of the EEC that the EP was developed within the framework of the SCES, the final results of training and 8 competencies of training are clearly formulated and correspond to the direction of training of a specialist of a general practitioner. Training in EP is implemented in accordance with the mission, goals and expected results of training and reflects the needs and expectations of practical health care and society as a whole, which is reflected in the passport of the educational Programme, the syllabuses of each discipline.

The EP "General Medicine" includes theoretical (basic) and practical components aimed at strengthening the clinical training of students. The basic competencies include several types: competencies in the field of general education, which allow students to use in the professional activities of a doctor; knowledge in the field of natural sciences (social, humanitarian, economic), biomedical and clinical sciences; the ability and readiness to acquire new knowledge necessary for daily professional activities and in continuous medical education and continuous professional development. It also contains a number of competencies that shape the mission and the final result of training: support for the level of competence, information literacy, ethical behavior, personality integrity, honesty, altruism, service to others, loyalty to the professional code, justice and respect for others.

Economic and organizational and managerial competencies allow us to know the basic principles of management, marketing, medical audit, medical insurance in the professional activity of a doctor; understanding the goals and methods of state regulation of the economy, the role of the public sector in the economy.

Practical components of professional competence that strengthen the student's clinical preparation are aimed at: the formation of diagnostic activities; the ability to assign and interpret the results of modern instrumental, laboratory and functional research methods; the ability to make a diagnosis and draw up a treatment plan for patients of all ages, taking into account their needs and requests, and, if necessary, refer patients to relevant related specialists; the ability to diagnose the main diseases in patients of all ages. Preventive activities are aimed at building the ability of students to conduct preventive procedures, the ability to conduct medical examinations of the population. Rehabilitation competence develops the skills of dispensing physiotherapy procedures. Psychological and pedagogical competence develops the skills of working with patients individually and in organized teams. The research competence is aimed at the ability to analyze scientific literature, conduct research work, take part in solving individual research and applied research tasks for the development of new methods and technologies in the field of health care.

The final learning outcomes of the EP "General Medicine" are determined on the basis of professional standards, expressed through competencies and formulated both at the level of the entire Programme, as well as at the level of the module and a separate discipline.

The formation of the final learning outcomes is based on the results of the previous level – the college, which was created on the basis of the KRMU. The results of training are formed both at the level of the entire Programme and in each course of study. From course to course, the results of the previous course are fulfilled and expanded in accordance with new competencies.

Main criteria for achievement of key results are continuity, interconnection of modules and disciplines. The competence approach, learning outcomes and credits are interrelated and based on the Dublin descriptors. Descriptors reflect the learning outcomes and are expressed in the ability of students to achieve the final learning outcomes of the educational Programme.

The final learning outcomes of the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine" are aimed at observing the principle of practice-oriented and patient-oriented learning, the main principles of which are reflected in the documents "Academic Policy" and "Code of Academic Honesty".

The final learning outcomes are also achieved by forming an individual learning path, implemented through elective disciplines. The submitted documents contain the CED (approved at the meeting of the Academic Council on 25.02.21, pr. No. 4), which includes an extensive base of elective disciplines: 2 elective courses in general education disciplines (GED), 7 in basic disciplines (BD) and 25 in profiling disciplines.

EEC experts confirmed that when formulating the results of training of the EP "General Medicine", the developers took into account their compliance with the selected level of training - bachelor's degree. Compliance with the requirements for learning outcomes at different levels is set by the Dublin Descriptors and the National Qualifications Framework for Higher Education (NQF HE). Employers as a stakeholder are involved in the development of student learning outcomes.

In addition, during the interviews with students, it was revealed that the students themselves also participated in the development of the final learning outcomes through participation in CEP meetings.

The EP "General Medicine" includes competence in research activities and disciplines that allow to give knowledge and skills to master research. Thus, in the 2nd year, the discipline "Fundamentals of scientific research and biostatistics" is presented, in addition, a Council of Young Scientists and a student scientific society was established in the university (order No.53 of 03.05.2012). Every year, a competition of research works of students is held, including in the specialty "General Medicine" dedicated to the "Day of Science". Winners are sent to participate in the Republican Olympiads and competitions of research works.

Thus, the final learning outcomes formulated in the "General Medicine" EP allow a graduate of a bachelor's degree to continue studying both in residency and in a master's degree.

#### 2.2 Organization and structure of the Educational Programme

EEC experts confirmed that the structure and content of the working curricula of the EP "General Medicine" comply with the State Standard of Education and Science, the rules for the organization of the educational process on credit technology of training (Order No. 152 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 20.04.2011, with amendments and additions dated 12.10.2018), the results of training are formed on the basis of the Dublin descriptors of the appropriate level and are expressed through competencies, training is carried out on credit technology, the sequence of studying disciplines is built in compliance with the system of pre- and post-requisites.

The process of development and approval of the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine" is determined by external internal regulatory documents and the work of collegial bodies: Academic

Council and CEP, whose members are faculty members (Ligai Z., Duisenov N, Makhambetova D., Eshimbetova S, Nugmanova A.), students (Mokhirev A. 5th year, Oralbayev N. 6th year, Tanebergen S. 4th year, Smagulov S. 6th year), employers (KodasbayevA., Sadykov B.).

The procedure for the development, implementation, evaluation of the effectiveness and improvement of the educational Programme is determined by the Academic Policy of the University, which was approved by the decision of the Academic Council of the University on August 27, 2021, Protocol No. 1.

The algorithm for the interface of credits, competencies and learning outcomes is prescribed in the Instruction for the development of the educational Programme of higher and postgraduate education, approved at the meeting of the Academic Council on February 28, 2019, Minutes No.7.

EEC experts, having analyzed these documents, confirm that these documents reflect the process of development and approval of EP with the area of responsibility of each structural unit.

The EP "General Medicine" is developed on the basis of international educational standards – the National Qualifications Framework, the Dublin Descriptors, the European Qualifications Framework. The procedure for the development, implementation, evaluation of the efficiency and improvement of the university's EP is set out in the Academic Policy of the university (decision of the SC dated 14.08.2020, protocol No. 11).

In accordance with the State Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the academic year within the framework of academic freedom is divided into academic periods: semesters. The full academic load of one academic year corresponds to at least 60 academic credits and corresponds to at least 1,800 academic hours in one academic year. At the same time, during one semester, the student masters at least 30 academic credits.

The structure of the undergraduate educational Programmes contains a complete list of academic disciplines grouped into cycles of general education (GED), basic (BD) and profiling disciplines (PD) for both mandatory and elective components, as well as the completion of professional internships and concludes with the final certification. The duration of undergraduate educational Programmes is at least 240 credits (4 years), 300 credits (5 years), internships at least 60 credits (1 year), 120 credits (2 years).

The forms of monitoring and evaluation of training results are prescribed in the EP: current and midterm control, interim certification, final state certification. The score is given on a 100-point scale in accordance with the point-rating letter system of knowledge assessment.

The information available in the EP indicates the availability of a useful study area, material and technical base and technical means of training, a sufficient fund of educational and scientific literature: 3 educational buildings, an educational and laboratory base (2245.9 sq.m.), a dormitory for 200 places, a library (642.91 sq.m.), a book fund (536,840 units), an educational and clinical center (370 sq.m.), a "mini-polyclinic" (150 sq.m.), 75 clinical bases located in Almaty and Almaty region and 8 regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

In addition to the mandatory component, the university component formed with the participation of employers, there is a component of choice formed by the students themselves. Students, with the help of advisors, form IEPs, in accordance with the TEP, WC and CED, which contributes to the student's awareness of responsibility for his/her learning process.

In the EP "General Medicine", at least one third of the volume of academic loans is provided to a student for independent work, the role of a teacher in this type of work is reduced to generating and consulting.

During the analysis of the structure of the EP, it was found that the volume of one module includes two or more academic disciplines. The assignment of loans to educational components depends on the degree of complexity, the amount of material studied, the load and the time required to achieve the established learning outcomes. At the same time, the labor intensity of one Kazakh academic credit (30 academic hours) corresponds to 1 ECTS credit and 1 academic hour is equal to 50 minutes.

The forms of education and teaching provided for in the EP include: lecture courses, seminars, practical/laboratory work, clinical practice, research activities and independent work. Teaching and

control methods are indicated in syllabuses. All forms of education use both traditional and interactive teaching methods.

The main types of professional practice in the field of general medicine are: in the 1st year of training practice "First pre-medical care" - 2 credits, which is held in the Training Clinical Center; in the 3rd year of training practice "Introduction to the clinic and nursing practice" - 2 credits; in the 4th year of training there is a production practice "Assistant resident doctor" - 4 credits; in the 5th year there is a production practice "Assistant emergency doctor" - 3 credits.

Integration of disciplines is reflected in the Model curricula and syllabuses and discussed at meetings of departments, CEP, regulated by the protocols of approvals, indicating prerequisites and postrequisites, is taken into account when drawing up class schedules.

When attending practical classes at the Department of Anatomy, as well as at the Department of Pathological Anatomy with Forensic Medicine, experts noted that in the educational process, teaching methods are actively used to develop clinical skills at practical classes of departments of theoretical profile by including clinical situations in the learning process (situational tasks), using test tasks with a clinical focus, in particular, analysis of changes in the cellular composition of blood in leukemias, principles of tumor metastasis by the lymphatic system.

Also, during the presence at the classes of both theoretical and clinical disciplines, the use of innovative teaching methods was confirmed: "TBL", "Interrupted case", "Work in small groups", "Roleplaying game", good knowledge of teaching staff in time management was noted, while observing the plan of the practical lesson.

At the Faculty of General Medicine there is a practical training clinic equipped with modern equipment designed for the work of students, certification of practical skills in clinical disciplines, examinations in industrial practice, there is a phantom office including phantoms, simulators of clinical examination and treatment, dental models, simulators, Pirogov's table. Includes in its structure a multimedia class designed for demonstration of educational films and presentations.

To acquire deeper knowledge and skills in the specialty, there are components of choice, with which students get acquainted in advance at the annual Elective Fair and choose the most interesting subject. In case of difficulty in choosing an elective discipline, the student turns to the advisor and they together form the student's learning path.

The qualification obtained as a result of mastering the EP "General Medicine" corresponds to the 6th level of the National Qualification Framework in Medical Education and, consequently, the structure of qualifications in the European Higher Education Area (ESG 1.2).

Upon completion of studies in the field of general medicine, undergraduates receive a diploma on obtaining the first higher medical education with the academic degree "Bachelor of Medicine" qualification "Specialist of General Medicine" and the issuance of an application in Kazakh, Russian and English languages. Bachelor's graduates also receive a "Diploma Supplement" (international document) in English indicating the skills that the graduate possesses.

At the end of the internship, graduates receive a diploma with the qualification "General Practitioner", a certificate of completion of internship and applications in Kazakh, Russian and English languages and "Diploma Supplement".

In KRMU, the principles of equality in relation to staff and students are observed and the necessary moral and ethical qualities are formed in students in the process of training under the guidance of a supervisor, mentor or teacher. Compliance with these principles is regulated in the Academic Policy. The EP "General Medicine" was developed on the principles of equality with the participation of teaching staff, students, representatives of practical health care and employers. Thus, it was established that representatives of practical health care participated in the implementation of the educational Programme: The City Cardiology Center of DHC in Almaty, the State Clinical Hospital No. 5 in Almaty.

#### **2.3 Content of the Educational Programme**

In the course of the detailed EP analysis, it was established that the modules of all courses are integrated vertically and horizontally. So, if in the 2nd year there is a teaching of modular disciplines

"Nervous system and sensory organs 1", "Cardiovascular system 1", "Respiratory system 1", which are based on the module "Fundamentals of anatomy, physiology, histology and biochemistry", then in the third year there is a teaching of subsequent modular disciplines "Nervous system and sensory organs 2", "Cardiovascular system 2", "Respiratory system 2", based on the study of previous modules. Thus, the connection of academic disciplines to each other can be traced. The study of disciplines ends with a final control, the form of which is determined by the university. Elective courses have a pronounced professional orientation and are oriented to the needs of the labor market. Students have the opportunity to form an individual educational path of study, taking into account the specialization that will be in demand in practical health care after graduation. For example, CED includes such disciplines as "Fundamentals of Clinical Oncology", "Reproductive Health of Men", "Urological Surgery", "Emergency Traumatology", etc. However, when familiarizing with the CED and taking into account the fact that a sufficient number of foreign students' study at the university, experts noted that the CED does not provide for the study of the health care system of various countries.

The ratio of competency components changes at different levels of training. In general, the share of the operational component of the specialist's competence increases to the senior courses, which reflects the practice-oriented nature of the educational process.

Different levels of clinical skills are structured according to the specific stage of the training Programme and the corresponding level of clinical base, depending on the degree of complexity of medical care. The training Programme is designed in such a way that students master knowledge and skills on the principle of "simple to complex". As training progresses, the level of responsibility gradually increases so that they are ready to conduct independent clinical activities after completing their training.

Scientific knowledge about the humanities and the arts, in particular linguistic disciplines in the State language, languages of inter-ethnic and inter-State communication, historical aspects of Kazakhstan, as well as a block of socio-political and philosophical subjects, is included in the composition of GED (general educational disciplines).

The composition of the database (basic disciplines) includes subjects that allow to know and apply the scientific principles and achievements of basic biomedical sciences, to know the structure and functions of organs at the level from molecules to cells of organs and the entire body in the norm and pathology, taking into account the age characteristics of the patient.

The structure of the PD (profiling disciplines) includes disciplines that include the study of public health in all its manifestations: clinical data on diseases, injuries, poisonings, etc., methods of treatment, diagnosis, emergency and scheduled medical care. There is a study of the public health system, in comparison with the global and national aspects, the health system, the national health system and the health care system.

To ensure the content of academic disciplines at all levels of education and achieve the results of training in each discipline, the departments develop syllabuses, which are analyzed at the meetings of the CEP and approved at the meeting of the AC.

It has been established that the syllabuses are reviewed annually, updated taking into account changes in the labor market, the interest of employers, the desire for innovation, which contribute to improving the quality of specialist training and the adaptation of graduates in production activities and the business environment. The syllabuses are reviewed and updated once a year, at the end of the school year, and approved for the next school year.

For each discipline of the working curriculum for all specialties, the EMCD is developed, which is annually compiled by the teaching staff, reviewed and approved at the department meeting, formed in a separate folder and stored in the department.

The training and methodological complex contains: a working curriculum (syllabuses) for the disciplines of the mandatory component and the component of choice; working curricula; control and measuring tools.

The analysis of the CED showed that the catalogues of electives are formed separately for each course, specialty and direction of study of students. The choice of elective disciplines is based on the

principle of supplementing the competencies required in further professional activity. At the same time, the CED is a list of all disciplines of the component of choice, containing the code, cycle, prerequisites, postrequisites, the volume of disciplines in loans, a brief description of the discipline with an indication of the purpose of study, content and expected results.

The formation and approval of the CED is carried out by the department for academic work. The structure and content of the CED are available to students on paper and electronic media on the university website, at the registrar's office, the advisor's office, the dean's office, at the department/course.

Every year, the content of existing disciplines is adjusted, less relevant disciplines are abolished, covering a narrow topic – combined with related disciplines and enlarged.

After the approval of the catalog of elective disciplines at the Academic Council and passing the procedure for enrolling students in disciplines, the departments develop and approve educational and methodological complexes at meetings of the Committee of Educational Programmes of the General Medicine Faculty.

Members of the EEC drew attention to the fact that the CED for foreign students and domestic students are identical, although the peculiarities of health systems in different countries have significant differences.

#### 2.4 Basic Biomedical Sciences

The composition of the database (basic disciplines) includes disciplines, the study of which implies knowledge of the structure and function of organs at the level from molecules to cells of organs and the entire body in the norm and pathology, taking into account the age characteristics of the patient.

Analysis of the content of the EP "General Medicine" showed that the main biomedical disciplines are included mainly in the first two years of study, which ensures the mastery of basic knowledge, skills and abilities necessary for further study of clinical disciplines.

Implementing the principle of student-centered learning, the number of students in the group is set at 12 people. This number is optimal for organizing discussions and team methods of training, seminars, business and role-playing games, which are held by teachers in classes.

According to the 2019 State Standard, the 4th year provides for a modular learning technology, which has been introduced into the educational process since the 1st year of study, completing internship studies. Course 1 provides for "General mandatory modules", which include the components of compulsory disciplines and the module "Socio-political knowledge", the total number of credits - 41.

The cycle of basic disciplines (90 credits) consists of the "Module of Molecular Biology, Biochemistry and Biophysics" (11 credits), "Module of Morphology and Human Physiology" (11 credits), «Introduction to the Profession" (16 credits), "Compulsory Modules in the Specialty" (21 credits), "Fundamentals of Scientific Research" Module (25 credits). Optional component – 3 credits. Educational practice – 3 credits. Profiling disciplines make - 144 credits. The ratio of biomedical disciplines to profiling subjects is 1:1.8.

In the syllabuses on biomedical disciplines, advances have been made in the use of digital technologies, coronavirus research and its impact on systems and organs. All relevant changes in the syllabuses of biomedical disciplines were discussed at the meetings of the CEP. Taking into account the requirements of the NLA, the thematic plan is updated annually, taking into account new scientific achievements over 5 years. For example, during an interview with teachers at the Department of Pathological Anatomy and Pathological Physiology with a course in forensic medicine, it was established that the section "Forensic Medicine" was introduced for students of the "General Medicine".

Checklists have been developed for each discipline in the departments. For example, in the course of attending practical classes at the Department of Anatomy, the members of the commission noted that the following assessment sheets were used during the class: self-assessments, assessments of colleagues, testing, oral questioning, filling in an intellectual map, and at the Department of Pathological Anatomy - assessment of a macro- and micro-preparation, a situational task.

#### **2.5 Clinical Sciences**

The structure of the PD (profiling disciplines) includes disciplines that include the study of public health in all its manifestations: clinical data on diseases, injuries, poisonings, etc., methods of treatment, diagnosis, emergency and scheduled medical care. In addition, the public health system, the national health system and the medical care system are being studied. Clinical disciplines are represented by the following modules: "Fundamentals of surgical diseases", "Fundamentals of obstetrics and gynecology", "Infectology", "Fundamentals of general medical practice", "Fundamentals of neurology, psychiatry, narcology", "Emergency medical care". In addition, the following disciplines are included in this section: "Internal diseases", "General medicine", "Otorhinolaryngology", "Ophthalmology", "Infectious diseases", "Neurology and psychiatry". The number of credits allocated to profile disciplines is 144.

Starting from the 3rd-4th year, when students start studying clinical disciplines, the maximum number of students in the group will be 8 people. Students master the disciplines of the clinical profile at the relevant departments, which are based directly on clinical bases.

Teaching and assessment methods are also becoming different. For example, in the "Fundamentals of Surgical Diseases" discipline, checklists are used: estimates of a drawing, a logical-didactical scheme, communication skills of a student, practical skills, presentations in a multimedia format, a thematic crossword puzzle.

In the relevant disciplines, students acquire skills and abilities: to carry out professional activities taking into account the moral and legal norms accepted in society, compliance with the rules of medical ethics, academic honesty, laws and regulations on working with confidential information, maintaining medical confidentiality, working in a team, defending their point of view, and the ability to find compromises.

The Programme focuses on key competencies, including for effective and safe patient care, which is reflected in training methods (situation analysis, patient examination, case discussion, patient supervision, participation in rounds and clinical conferences, simulation training, standardized patient).

The main types of professional practice in the field of general medicine are: in the 1st year of training practice "First pre-medical care" - 2 credits, which is held in the Training Clinical Center; in the 3rd year of training practice "Introduction to the clinic and nursing practice" - 2 credits; in the 4th year of training there is a production practice "Assistant resident doctor" - 4 credits; in the 5th year there is a production practice "Assistant emergency doctor" - 3 credits.

The following hospitals of the city of Almaty are the clinical bases for the training and industrial practices of students of the 3rd, 4th, 5th courses: SPE on the REM of the CCH No. 1 of Almaty; SPE on the REM of the CCH No. 4 of Almaty; SPE on the REM CCCH No. 2 of Almaty; SPE on the REM CCH of the city of Almaty; SPE on the REM "Hospital of emergency medical care" of the city of Almaty; SPE on the REM "Hospital of emergency medical care" of the city of Almaty; SPE on the REM university clinic "Aksai"; SPE on the REM city perinatal center of Almaty; SPE on the REM perinatal center of Almaty; emergency medical station DHC of Almaty.

In order to undergo a specialized internship "Practice in PMSP" in the 6th year (10 credits) in internship, contracts were concluded with medical institutions with a profile – "Primary medical and social practice". Thus, there are agreements and contracts with the following medical organizations at the EP "General Medicine": SPE on the REM "Zhambyl Central District Hospital"; SPE on the REM "Central District Hospital"; SPE on the REM "Talgar Central District Hospital"; SPE on the REM "Enbekshy-Kazakh Central District Hospital"; SPE on the REM "Karasai Multidisciplinary Interdistrict Hospital"; SPE on the REM "Almaty Regional Children's Clinical Hospital"; SPE on the REM "City Polyclinic No. 10" in Almaty; SPE on the REM "City Polyclinic No. 3" in Almaty; SPE on the REM "City Polyclinic No. 3" in Almaty;

During the analysis of the documentation, it was established that the Department of Professional Practice and Clinical Work concluded agreements on joint cooperation with 75 clinical bases: research institutes -4; scientific centers -7; regional hospitals -1; city clinical hospitals -12; city centers -8; medical centers -20; city polyclinics -14; district polyclinic -1; ambulance station -1; rehabilitation center -1; district hospital -2; dispensaries -2. According to professional practice, 30 contracts have been concluded.

At the same time, in order to comply with the principles of patient safety, the KRMU has a system for practicing clinical skills. For example, in the 3rd year, students of the EP "General Medicine" practice the skills of communication with patients, the stages of clinical examination of patients of the general profile. Further, in the 4th year, according to the EP, "General medicine", students perform a clinical examination of patients in the areas – "Surgical diseases", "Children's diseases", "Obstetrics and gynecology", "Internal diseases", and also make appointments according to treatment protocols. The teacher demonstrates the skills of interviewing the patient, initial examination with demonstration of communication skills.

At the same time, the patient can be students or volunteers themselves. Students then practice these skills on each other or on volunteers under the supervision of a teacher. Before the clinical part of the lesson, students are instructed in safety.

When interviewing students, the members of the commission confirmed that in clinical conditions, students are allowed to assist teachers during the operation, assist the teacher during the reception (work in "four hands"), in senior courses – to conduct an independent reception under the supervision of the teacher, work with the information system of medical document management. Experts also noted that when visiting clinic No. 8 the doctor Balnur Kenzhebekkyzy was assisted by the student of the 5th year Buzhabaev A.

Members of the EEC noted that in order to deepen knowledge and skills for students, Programmes were provided within the framework of a practical school, for example, the Department of Surgical Diseases with an anesthesiology and resuscitation course in 2016-2017, 2017-2017, 2018-2019 academic years held additional educational events on the topic "Topical issues of endovideo surgery" with the subsequent issuance of an official certificate of completion of this course.

## 2.6 Scientific Method

The principle of "learning through science" is carried out in the university through various forms of activity. EEC experts found confirmation of this during the study of the documentation. In particular, it has been established that students are involved in the research work of faculty departments, including in the field of general medicine through temporary scientific teams created for the implementation of research projects and contracts for medical services. Scope of the obtained scientific results: departments/courses of the university, organizations of primary health care, social protection of the population, psychological services of primary health care, university curricula.

The obligatory part of the EP is the scientific component, which implies the involvement of students in the participation in scientific work, the introduction of achievements of science, evidence-based medicine in each academic discipline. One of the elements of the scientific method is the CED, approved at the meeting of the Academic Council of Ave. No. 4 dated 25.02.2021. For example, scientific achievements are included in the following elective courses: "Dyshormonal hyperplasias and breast cancer", "Chronic dermatoses in GP practice", "Diagnostic laparoscopy", "Endoscopic surgery", "Duplex scanning of neck and head vessels", "Reproductive technologies in the treatment of infertility".

In order to further develop research activities at the university, on the basis of Order No.53 of 03.05.2012, a Council of Young Scientists and a student scientific society was established, which operates to date and the work of which is regulated by the Regulations on the Student Scientific Community. The student scientific community solves the following tasks: coordination of the activities of student scientific societies; promotion and popularization of scientific and social activities among students; assistance in the publication and implementation of the results of scientific works; assistance in participation in international and interuniversity scientific conferences, symposia, seminars, scientific congresses (D. Kharshenko took part in the Euro-Asian International Congress on Anti-Age Medicine; L. Kairatkyzy - in the Republican Scientific Conference of Young Scientists and Students "Gender Policy: a Modern View of Youth"); assistance in the presentation of scientific works for grants, scholarships, awards and other forms of moral and material encouragement, Olympiads (Zhylangoz U., Vazartsev S. took part in the Olympiad on Pediatrics).

Every year, the University holds a competition of student scientific works dedicated to the "Day of Science". The winners of this competition are sent to participate in the 2nd round of the republican competition. One of the student works was the work of Khairullina S. (2nd year) "Asymptomatic bacteriuria in pregnant women of Almaty".

The university has its own scientific journal, in which students can print their scientific works.

The mandatory element of the curriculum implementation is the IWRT and IWS. To perform them, the student is involved in research work, the results of which are then protected in front of the audience. Subsequent questions from the audience also stimulate the development of critical and analytical thinking in both the speaker and the audience.

Every year, the University holds a competition of student scientific works dedicated to the "Day of Science". The winners of this competition are sent to participate in the 2nd round of the republican competition.

It should be noted that when performing the work "Provision of primary medical care to the population of the regions of Kazakhstan using mobile medical complexes (MMC)", interns were attached to the field trips.

Also, during the performance of the work "Provision of psychological assistance to families with children with disabilities", counseling was carried out by the faculty's teaching staff "General Medicine" together with students and interns.

Nevertheless, the university does not have a process for applying for grant funding for various research areas, and in the context of the ongoing modernization of medical education, this is one of the important indicators of the effectiveness of R&D teachers and one of the priority areas of the university's development.

# 2.7 Behavioral and Social Sciences and Medical Ethics

The accredited EP includes behavioral, social sciences, medical ethics, and medical jurisprudence that provide the knowledge, skills, and attitudes needed to understand socio-economic, demographic, and cultural relationships, knowledge of medical health issues, the national health system, and patient rights.

For the purpose of comprehensive training of students, according to the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 № KR DSM-12/2020, the curriculum includes the following categories of sciences: social, social and socio-political knowledge module, which is represented by the disciplines of sociology, psychology, political science, cultural studies; socio-social module (disciplines "Academic honesty", "Service to society", "Mangilik El"); behavioral, personal development module, which consists of the disciplines "Leadership", "Critical thinking and analysis"; humanitarian, is represented by the disciplines "Modern history of Kazakhstan"; "Philosophy". The development of relations is facilitated by the study of language disciplines: "Foreign language", "Kazakh (Russian) language", "Professional Kazakh (Russian) language"; "Professionally-oriented foreign language" and "Latin language".

At the same time, the commission members drew attention to the fact that with a rather high proportion of foreign students among students in the "General Medicine" Programme, their involvement in various advisory bodies is minimal.

#### 2.8 Educational Technologies, Learning Methods and Practical Training

The Commission established that the system of accounting for the educational load of students and teachers is organized and maintained in accordance with the "Rules for the organization of the educational process on credit technology of education", approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 20.04.2011 No.152.

Accounting for the labor intensity of educational work is carried out by the amount of teaching material measured in credits. To improve the educational process at the university, various teaching methods are used to form certain competencies.

According to the information presented in the syllabuses, the methods used in the lecture: press conference; problematic; review; information; interactive; binary; lectures are held remotely with the participation of professors and associate professors of partner universities.

Modern educational technologies with evidence-based practice for clinical and non-clinical learning are used: TBL; CBL; RBL; PBL; SBL; GOSCE; situation analysis; standardized patient (SP), mixed hybrid simulation; project-based training at the internship level; critical analysis method.

Departments develop and use different techniques and mechanisms for introducing innovations in the EP. The current and final assessment of knowledge is carried out using Moodle computer Programmes or LMS. The test centre has 240 computers with webcams to ensure that the training needs are fully met. To achieve the quality of the educational process, a system is used to check for plagiarism, both test tasks developed by the teaching staff and students' responses.

WIFI is available on site, in the buildings and in the hostel. Free access - 50%,

secure access - 50%. It also allows students and faculty to be mobile. The library has an office with free access to the Internet and electronic databases. Members of the commission had an opportunity to check the work of students with databases.

The administrative staff includes a call-center, one of the tasks of which is to collect information from faculty and students about the quality of the work of the remote technology department. The Marketing Department works to the same end. To date, no complaints have been received.

In the course of attending practical classes, the experts of the EEC made sure that in addition to traditional methods, innovative teaching methods that are practice-oriented are actively introduced in the KRMU. Methods used in practical classes: Case-study; blitz survey; work in small groups; communicative method; role-playing games; method of "brainstorming"; method of group discussion; method of teaching in small groups; teaching at the patient's bedside; training in a clinic with the participation of a real patient; training in clinical skills in the TCC; training in primary health care; teaching using web-technologies. In the pedagogical process, multimedia systems are used, which provide extensive opportunities for students to report within a scientific module or mug, analyze clinical cases with simultaneous demonstration of video or photo images.

Thus, when attending classes in anatomy and pathological anatomy, teachers actively used the data of the system: Pirogov's table, touch boards, a multimedia projector with a screen, on which students saw drawings, situational tasks and questions.

At the Department of Propaedeutics of Internal Diseases, according to the students, the method of "duplication of the teacher" is used, and when attending the PO GPD in the 502 group on the topic "Differential diagnosis of viral hepatitis", the members of the commission got acquainted with the method of teaching "conference", where the roles were distributed among the students: speaker, moderator, experts, audience. The practical lesson was successfully conducted by the teacher Zhumataeva S.A.

Teaching methods are prescribed in the methodological instructions for teachers "Teaching methods at a medical university", approved at the meeting of the Academic Council No. 1 dated August 26, 2021. The use of innovative technologies in the educational process is evidenced by acts of implementation.

During distance learning, the faculty actively used the possibilities of remote educational technologies (4 TB of memory). First of all, it should be noted that the department employs employees with medical education, which greatly contributes to the understanding of the goals and objectives of the implementation of the EP and the achievement of the final learning outcomes. Platforms on which the faculty and students work: "Platonus" and "Moodle". These systems contain educational content of all disciplines, including 500 own video lectures of teaching staff.

Teachers of the departments of the Faculty of General Medicine underwent advanced training courses on the use of information and communication technologies in education with the receipt of appropriate certificates. The necessary competencies for the use of IT tools are acquired by students of the EP in the disciplines "Information and communication technologies", IT in practical health care.

During the interview, students especially noted the video lectures of the teacher Taufik Nabievich.

For each created video, the TS received an act of implementation. For example, for the creation of a video lecture "Clinical Pharmacology (General Issues)", teachers Zhumatova M.G. and Baitemirova T.A. received an implementation act No. 1312.

During the pandemic, faculty and students mastered work on the Zoom platform. Since the teaching staff of the departments has done a lot to train students online, it is necessary to analyze all this work and leave all the necessary materials for off-line training. Taking into account the fact that the teachers were actively engaged in this type of activity, it is recommended to continue to use the existing potential of IT-technologies of the university.

## 2.9 Management of the Educational Programme

According to the submitted documentation and during the conversation with the management of the university, it was established that the coordination of educational activities is carried out by the department for academic work, the main functions of which include: analysis of domestic and foreign experience in the field of medical education, adaptation of the educational Programmes of the strategic partner and leading medical schools in the educational process of the university; planning, organization and coordination of work on the development and implementation of educational Programmes, control of their compliance with the requirements of the State standards of higher professional, postgraduate and additional education and educational Programmes, normative acts of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan; planning, management, control and improvement of organizational and methodological processes for the application of innovative educational technologies.

The University has a process and procedure for the development and approval of an educational Programme (ESG G1.2). When creating "General medicine", the developers were guided by the Rules for the organization of the educational process on credit technology of training, approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 20.04.2011 No. 152 (with amendments and additions No. 563 dated 12.10.2018). The main documents of the development of the EP were: international educational standards, the National Qualifications Framework, the Dublin Descriptors, the European Qualifications Framework. According to the professional standard, the qualification level of the undergraduate is NQF level 6 (ORC levels - 6).

The procedure for the development, implementation, evaluation of the effectiveness and improvement of the university's EP is determined by the University's Academic Policy (SC dated 14.08.2020, protocol No. 11).

Both the teaching staff and employers participated in the structure of the EP in the formation of the variable part.

During the development of the EP "General Medicine", expert opinions were received from employers. The reviews were given by the chief physician of the State Clinical Hospital No. 5 B. Sadykov, the director of the State Clinical Hospital on the right to health of the city cardiology center of DHC of Almaty A. Kodaspayev.

Also, the participation of students themselves in the development of EP is confirmed- students participate in the work of all collegial bodies as full members.

The Dean's Office of the Faculty of General Medicine, the CEP and the AC are responsible for ensuring the achievement of educational standards, improving the quality of academic management, including by monitoring the implementation of innovative teaching and assessment technologies by departments, training personnel in the field of quality assurance of the educational process. Examination of the quality of the educational process is regularly carried out by the departments through mutual attendance of classes, conducting open classes, discussing them at meetings of the departments.

The CPC includes experienced methodologists from among professors, associate professors, assistants, representatives of students and practical health care: Makhanbetkulova D. (PhD, Chair of General Medical Practice), Eshimbetova S. (Candidate of Medical Sciences, Chair of Psychiatry, Narcology and Neurology), Nugmanova A. (Candidate of Medical Sciences, Chair of Children's Diseases), Salimgereev B. (Candidate of Medical Sciences, Chair of Anatomy with courses of

Physiology and Histology), Mukashev M. (Deputy Chief Physician of the CEH), Tanirbergen C (student of the 4th year), etc.

According to the Regulation on the CEP, its main function is to develop educational Programmes, consider issues of educational and methodological support of the educational process; discuss and make proposals for improving the educational process; organize the development of textbooks, teaching aids; consider the introduction of various forms of methodological work; consider the catalogue of elective disciplines; organize and conduct seminars, conferences, meetings to improve educational and methodological and scientific work.

The Department of Academic Work is a structural unit of the University, responsible for the organization of educational activities and educational and methodological work at the University. The priority direction in the work of the department is the introduction and implementation of EP, improvement of its structure and content, implemented in accordance with the Programme for the development of scientific and educational activities of the university, the requirements of international standards and consumers of educational services – the state, society, employers.

According to the submitted "Regulations on the Department of Academic Work", this department interacts with the CEP, deans and other departments involved in the organization of the educational process. The main task is to manage the curricula and the learning process.

According to the submitted Regulations on the Academic Council, the main functions are: organization of the examination of educational and methodological materials; consideration of issues of educational and methodological support of the educational process; discussion and approval of proposals for the improvement of draft normative legal documents relating to issues of methodological support; approval of developed textbooks, educational and methodological manuals, including on electronic media and didactic materials; consideration of the introduction of various forms of methodological work aimed at improving the educational process; approval of the catalogue of elective disciplines; organization and holding of seminars, conferences, meetings to improve educational and methodological work.

The Academic Council includes administrative staff, leading teachers, students, employers: Kusainova A. (Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs), Bakirova B. (Director of the Department of Academic Work), Duysenov N. (Dean of the Faculty of General Medicine), Berkutbaeva O. (Head of the Department of Planning and Control of the Educational Process), Esirgepova S. (Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Pathological Anatomy with a Course of Forensic Medicine), Madiarov V. (Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Surgery with a Course of Anesthesiology and Resuscitation), Abzaliev K. (Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Consultative and Diagnostic Center of the Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine JSC), Eskaliev E. (2nd year student), etc.

The Academic Council of the University discusses issues on the organization of educational and methodological work and the educational process and approves their implementation.

## 2.10 Relation to medical practice and health care system

The main goal of the "General Medicine" is the training of qualified specialists with a higher education; the disclosure of the diverse potential and self-realization of the student; the formation of the professional qualities of the student, such as – responsibility, the ability to work independently, communication skills, organizational abilities, the ability to make decisions, tactfulness for their implementation in professional activity; the formation of the student's personal qualities.

The principle of continuity of basic and postgraduate education Programmes is observed in the development of the EP. The connection between the educational Programme and the subsequent stage of professional training and further practical activities is carried out through the involvement of representatives of practical health care in the development and evaluation of EP. Thus, employers are included in the CEP and the Academic Council, and the Programme is evaluated by reviewing the content of the Programmes by representatives of practical health care. Expert opinions were received from employers. The reviews were given by the chief physician of the State Clinical Hospital No. 5 B.

Sadykov, the director of the State Clinical Hospital on the right to health of the city cardiology center of DHC of Almaty A. Kodaspayev.

To develop students' skills of independent learning and develop the ability and skills of lifelong learning, they are involved in seminars, Olympiads, professional competitions.

All graduates have the opportunity to continue their studies in residency or master's degree, to take advanced training courses in a specialty throughout their life.

Members of the EEC revealed that in the course of training in the "General Medicine" Programme, it is provided for quite early involvement of students in the professional environment. As a student develops and professionally develops, his activities become more complex and more responsible. For example, in the first year of study, students undergo the training practice "First pre-medical care", with the purpose of training in the provision of first emergency medical care in prehospital conditions. In the third year of study, students participate in the treatment and care of a patient in the process of completing the practice "Introduction to the clinic and nursing practice", where they learn the skills of caring for a sick nursing staff. In the fourth year, there is an "Assistant Physician Resident" internship, in which students master the skills of conducting simple medical manipulations under the guidance and control of the head of the practice. At the same time, skills in surgical diseases, internal diseases, childhood diseases, obstetrics and gynaecology are studied and practiced. In the fifth year of training, an internship "Assistant to the doctor of emergency and emergency care" is carried out. Students undergo internships at emergency medical stations, go on calls as part of the AEMC teams, performing all the necessary manipulations.

Internship in the 6th year of study, students undergo practical training "Practice in PMSP", where direct work as a doctor of "General medical practice" is carried out. This practical training is carried out at the level of primary health care, under the direct supervision of the curator of the department "General Medical Practice".

Students also meet with patients in the process of mastering profiling disciplines, since specialized training is provided at the bases of hospitals, medical centers, polyclinics and dispensaries. At this stage, professional orientation takes place, immersion in a professional environment, communication skills are established in an environment with nursing and medical personnel. Under the guidance of his teacher, the student trains the techniques and manipulations provided for in the curriculum.

Particular attention is paid to ensuring that the level of responsibility and complexity of clinical skills is gradually increased. These measures are necessary, first of all, to ensure the safety of patients and to ensure the effectiveness of training.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 38 standards: fully - 33, partially - 5, non-compliant - 0.

#### Standard 2: standard is fulfilled

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Activate the process of submitting applications to the competition commissions of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and other granting organizations for grant and Programme-targeted financing of research projects of teaching staff with the inclusion of young scientists and students (2.4., 2.5).

2) Using the results of the analysis of the demand for content, determine effective types of training based on remote technologies for their subsequent use in the educational process (2.8.).

3) In the Catalog of Elective Disciplines, disciplines for foreign students should be provided, taking into account the peculiarities of their national health care system (2.7.).

# Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS

# **Evidence of compliance:**

# **3.1 Evaluation policy and system**

EEC experts established that the policy of assessing students is based on the regulatory and legal documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan and internal regulatory documents: "Regulations on internal

quality assurance of educational activities of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University ";" Academic Policy "; "Regulations on Appeals"; "Regulations on the Certification Commission", available in the submitted documents. Internal regulatory documents are posted on the university's website and brought to the attention of students.

The process of development of internal regulatory documents on student evaluation policy was carried out by creating a working group consisting of teachers, students, representatives of the dean's office, the department of academic work, a lawyer and a specialist from the quality management system department. At the working meetings of this group, discussions were held on a number of issues related, inter alia, to the educational process of the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine", including on the student assessment policy. After discussion and execution, the document was considered and approved at the meeting of the SC of 24.07.2019. The responsibility for the evaluation policy is borne by the relevant officials of the Faculty of General Medicine – teaching staff, heads of departments, dean's office, as well as by the vice-rector for academic activities on the part of the management.

The main criteria for assessing the knowledge and skills of students are: the assessment must be reliable; the requirements of the exam must comply with the standards; the questions must be clear, clear, concise; if the instructor answered incorrectly, the teacher must explain what was required by the task condition; the assessment must be fair; the assessment must be effective, useful and appropriate.

Academic policy defines the principles, methods and practices of student assessment, which guarantee the objectivity of the acquired knowledge, skills and abilities. The department is responsible for the formation and implementation of the student assessment policy, which reflects this point in the syllabus in the Discipline Policy section. Syllabuses are approved at the cathedral meeting and at the CEP meeting.

The assessment methods are aimed at achieving the final learning outcomes and are prescribed in the academic policy: interview (OE – Oral examination); test questions with multiple choice (MCQs – Multiple Choice Questions); discussion of a clinical case (CbD – Case based Discussion); mini-CEX – mini-Clinical Evaluation Exercise); objective structured clinical examination (OSCE – Objective Structured Clinical Examination); assessment of the quality of medical documentation (AA – Audit Assessment Tool); self-assessment (SA – Self-Assessment); assessment of colleagues (PA – Peer Assessment); feedback (MSF – Multi-Source Feedback); portfolio assessment (PA – Portfolio assessment), etc.

When analyzing the documentation, the members of the EEC confirmed that the methods for evaluating all types of controls are published before the start of training in syllabuses and EMCD, which are posted on the educational portal on the page of the Faculty of General Medicine. Evaluation criteria are written in the syllabus of each discipline and published on the Moodle platform to ensure their objectivity and transparency. In the first lesson in the disciplines, teachers communicate to students the criteria for assessing individual educational achievements. In the educational journals, a sheet is provided to familiarize students with the department's policy and criteria for assessing knowledge.

To assess the level of mastering of competencies, the departments of the Faculty of General Medicine develop the results of training of the educational Programme, which are discussed at the CEP and approved by the AC. During the final control, the assessment is entered into the examination sheet for the academic discipline and the electronic journal "Platonus". Students can get acquainted with the results of the assessments by using a personal login and password.

The assessment of knowledge includes current and frontier controls, interim and final certification, which is reflected in the "Regulations on the conduct of current monitoring of academic performance, interim and final certification of students". For each form of control, a checklist has been developed, available in the syllabus.

The final grade for the discipline includes assessments of the admission rating and the final control (examination). In the case of examinations in 2 or 3 stages, the final score for the exam is formed by calculating the arithmetic average of the scores of all stages. The assessment of the current and milestone controls of academic performance (admission rating) is at least 60% of the final assessment of knowledge in the discipline, and the examination score is at least 40% of the final assessment of

knowledge in the discipline. The final score is calculated only if the student has a positive score on the final control. The results of the examination, according to the examination sheet, are transferred by the teacher to the registrar's office on the day of passing the examination and are entered into the automated information system no later than three days after the date of passing the examination.

The schedule of examinations is drawn up by the planning and control department and approved by the vice-rector for academic work. Then it is brought to the attention of the dean's office. The dean's office informs teachers and students. Students who have scored at least 50% as a result of the current control are allowed to pass the midterm control in the discipline. The rating of the admission to the midterm control is determined by the arithmetic mean of the current assessments of the discipline for all types of occupations divided by the total number of assessments. The maximum score for milestone controls in the discipline is 100 points maximum for each milestone control

The number and format of midterm controls, final control of knowledge in disciplines are reflected in the syllabus. The exam results, according to the examination sheet, are transmitted by the teacher to the registrar's office on the day of the exam and are entered into the automated information system (AIS Platonus) no later than three days after the date of the exam.

Separately, intermediate certification is provided for the integrated disciplines of the EP "General Medicine", consisting of separate blocks. The procedure is also reflected in the "Regulations on the current monitoring of academic performance, interim and final certification of students".

A student who does not agree with the result of the final control can file an appeal application to the chairperson of the appeal commission. For the period of the interim certification, by the order of the dean "General Medicine", subject appeal subcommittees are created (at least 3 people), the qualitative composition of which is determined by the discipline itself. In case of passing the exam in a block of disciplines, it is allowed to create one subject appellate subcommittee. The Appeals Board is governed by the "Appeals Regulations".

The results of students' achievements are displayed in academic journals, examination and credit sheets and credit books of students. The chief specialist of the office-registrator explained the work of this structural unit during the visit of experts. The experts were able to see a system for registering and recording the results of students' knowledge, which eliminates corruption risks, since points are automatically retransmitted from the testing center in the sheet.

The university introduced an additional paid semester of up to 6 weeks during the summer holidays to meet the needs for additional training, the elimination of academic indebtedness or the difference in curricula.

Departments annually update the test tasks for the final control in the amount of 30%. Their validity is determined by analyzing the pass: a test task is considered valid, to which 89% of students responded. The test tasks are distributed by difficulty levels: I level - 20%, II - 30%, III - 50%.

To assess the mastery of practical skills by students in clinical disciplines, the scope of the objective structured clinical examination methodology has been expanded, scenarios are being developed in the practical skills center, in addition, a mini-clinical examination is being taken. Independent experts (both internal and external) are involved in the adoption and evaluation of the mastery of practical skills in order to objectify the assessment. Assessment of students' skills is also carried out using in the training and simulation center on phantoms and instruments, standardized patients, in the clinic near the patient's bed, the solution of clinical situational problems, the protection of medical history, projects, diaries of training and production and production practice, corresponding to the goals and objectives of the EP and resulting in the consolidation of the results of training and mastering skills.

EEC experts confirmed on the basis of the study of the orders on the final state certification that to assess the educational achievements of students of the final courses, the commission includes practitioners of health care in the field of specialization, external examiners, specialists of related disciplines are involved.

The university uses assessment methods such as self-assessment and assessment of colleagues during work in small groups, assessment of SCES forms — presentation, discussion, completed project, critical

analysis of articles, medical histories, protection of the matrix, etc., providing for a departure from the traditional regulated assessment methods and requiring the student and teacher to master the skills of feedback.

For the formation and improvement of pedagogical skills at the university there are "Winter School" and "Summer School" for both young teachers and teachers with work experience, implementing the "General Medicine". Teachers receive professional competences in assessing knowledge and skills during their training. In addition, in order to guarantee the objectivity of the assessment, the quality of teaching is assessed through mutual visits, analysis and analysis of classes at meetings of departments and at meetings of the CEP.

At the end of the academic year, students are determined the level of academic performance for the year in the form of GPA. For each academic year for each course, the decision of the Academic Council establishes a minimum GPA – for the transfer of a student from the course to the course. The transfer of students from the course to the course is carried out on the basis of the established transfer score with mandatory consideration of prerequisites. Each discipline of the cycle of basic and profile disciplines of the previous course is a prerequisite for any discipline of the next course.

At the end of the academic year, the CEP meeting discusses the results of training, the criteria for mastering knowledge, skills and abilities, their improvement. This allows you to improve the quality of training, enter additional questions or topics in the IWS, change or leave the same number of grades per lesson.

#### **3.2** Evaluation that promotes and supports learning (formative assessment)

When determining the methods of assessing knowledge, the ratio of formative and summative assessments, the number of examinations, the form of control over the conduct of examinations are considered, the ratio of written and oral examinations is taken into account, specialized types of examinations are used: OSCE in the profiling disciplines and OSSE in the basic disciplines.

In the study of basic clinical disciplines, one general grade is given for knowledge. In modular study of disciplines, grades are given for each discipline separately, and then they are summed into one final grade. During the completion of the profiling disciplines, at the senior courses, the knowledge, practical and communication skills of students are assessed with the issuance of one general assessment. The methods of assessment, which are reflected in the academic policy of the university, are adopted by the department with the approval at the meeting of the CEP.

During the visit, EEC experts reviewed the syllabuses on anatomy, pathological anatomy, neurology, where they saw the thematic plan, disenchantment by type of activity, control and measuring tools, methodological materials, as well as educational journals of the same departments.

During the interview, the students confirmed that all the syllabuses were available to them from the moment of publication, that they were familiar with the knowledge assessment system, that the teachers were carrying out advisory work in preparation for the exams.

When visiting the Testing Center, the members of the commission noted that a system of proctoring, video surveillance and suppression of cellular signals and Wi-Fi access to the Internet was introduced, which excludes violation of the Rules of academic honesty: the bias of scoring by teachers and bad faith on the part of students. During the oral examination, the teachers on duty act as proctors.

During classes at the simulation center, students can get advice from teacher-trainers. To systematize the work, registration and registration in the simulation center, there is a schedule of teachers on duty and a schedule of visits to students (about which the experts were able to see).

In addition, routine (daily) controls are carried out based on the number of credits for studying a certain discipline.

When choosing a formative assessment method, the teacher's preferences are taken into account. An important role is played by the independent work of students, who form the portfolio of the student and which is the basis for assessing the competence of "self-development". The forms of conducting IWS are diverse (presentations, abstracts, compilation of crossword puzzles, glossaries, test tasks, registration of educational medical history, development of diagnostic algorithms, compilation, work and protection of the project, matrices, analysis of medical histories by nosology, etc.).

At the end of the classes, the departments analyze the compliance of the assessment method, ways to improve the mastery of educational material.

Responsibility and control of the quality of classes in accordance with the goals and objectives of the classes, the topics and the implementation of the necessary skills are the heads of departments. Analysis of conformity assessment is carried out at the departments, after the completion of classes, interim and final certification by comparing the formative assessment and the final assessment. If there is a significant inconsistency in the assessments, the validity and reliability of the assignments are checked by the decision of the department meeting.

Feedback is conducted at the end of each cycle, at the end of the study of each discipline by electronic questionnaire. The Quality Monitoring Department conducts an anonymous survey among students to obtain constructive feedback on the results of training and assessment methods. The questionnaires are studied, the results are submitted to the SC, sent to the e-mail of the faculty of the departments for discussion and development of measures to improve the educational process, raise the level of competence of teachers who received a low percentage when surveying students.

For example, when familiarizing with the results of the survey of students, the best teachers were identified Nurgozhaeva A.M., Skripnistaya O.B., Gotskaya A.N., Elhendi T., Frolov R.A. During the interview, students noted that at their suggestion, the university administration made changes in the ratio of oral and written examinations. At the suggestion of the students, this ratio was oral: testing = 65:35.

#### **3.3 Decision Supporting Assessment (Summative Assessment)**

An evaluation system has been developed and implemented in the KRMU, which is important for summing up the results of training (summary evaluation). The summative assessment is fair to students and corresponds to the results of knowledge and skills, and the final assessments confirm all areas of competence of students.

The obtained assessments correspond to the quality standards of training and the final learning outcomes, according to the educational Programme. The results of the knowledge assessment are recorded in an electronic system and become available to students on the day of the assessment. Teachers and students are provided with continuous feedback on academic performance that is open and accessible.

The Platonus AIS Programme provides a personal account of the student, where his/her data, individual curriculum, history of educational achievements are placed. The student has the opportunity to view the curriculum, the schedule of classes and sessions, the academic calendar. With the use of a personal password and login, get acquainted with the current academic performance.

During the interim and final certification, control and measuring tools are used using scorecards, which allows reducing corruption risks and eliminating conflicts of stakeholders. The quantitative data of the evaluation results are reflected in the syllabus and reflect the discipline policy and its final results.

The number of exams in each course is regulated by the EP. The forms of holding are proposed by the departments, considered at the meetings of the CEP and the Academic Council, approved by the decision of the Academic Council. Exams are distributed by semester, which allows you to avoid overloading during the interim assessment. The presented document "Elements of the EP "General Medicine" indicating the number and nature of examinations" presents the disciplines and their forms of control (most often it is either an oral survey or testing).

## **3.4 Quality Control**

After the next examination session, students are questioned to study students' opinions on the quality of teaching in the discipline, the examination procedure, etc., which are analyzed, worked out at meetings of departments, the CEP, the Academic Council and a plan of measures is drawn up to eliminate the identified shortcomings in the educational process. For example, according to the results

of the survey 77.9% of respondents answered that their knowledge was assessed objectively, 13% - more objectively than not.

When checking the quality of tasks used for knowledge control, a plagiarism checking system is used. In addition, the annual reports of the departments assess the reliability of evaluation methods by analyzing students' academic achievements. In case of a decrease in students' academic performance and insufficient reliability of the methods used, the reasons are analyzed and decisions are made on the necessary measures to eliminate them (processing of test tasks, control questions, situational tasks and other measuring instruments).

For the validity and reliability of evaluation methods, test tasks and situational clinical tasks are compiled by a group of testologists for each discipline, they are discussed at the departmental meeting, and then approved at the CPC meeting. When the tests are uploaded to the Testing Center, the test questions undergo an examination with a score on the point system and then they are provided to the trainers during the exam period.

To assess the mastery of practical skills by students in clinical disciplines, the scope of the objective structured clinical examination methodology has been expanded, scenarios are being developed in the practical skills center, in addition, a mini-clinical examination is being taken. Independent experts (both internal and external) are involved in the adoption and evaluation of the mastery of practical skills in order to objectify the assessment.

When conducting the final state certification to assess the educational achievements of graduate students, the commission includes specialists in practical health care in the specialization profile, external examiners, specialists in related disciplines are involved.

It should be noted that in KRMU there is a "Code of Academic Integrity" (posted on the website). In case of its violation, an act is drawn up, and the final assessment of the discipline is subject to cancellation. In case of repeated violation for the entire period of study, the student is subject to expulsion from the university.

Members of EEC noted that in the test center, the psychometric assessment of the validity of tests is carried out manually, which requires significant physical and time costs.

*The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria* of 14 standards: fully - 13, partially – 1, does not comply -0.

## Standard 4: standard is fulfilled

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Implement automated psychometric analysis of test tasks using software (3.4.).

## **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

# 4.1 Student Selection and Admission Policy

In the KRMU, admission of applicants is carried out in accordance with the admission rules PR-03-20-07, developed on the basis of the Law "On Education" and "Model Rules for Admission to Education Organizations Implementing Educational Programmes of Higher Education" No. 600 dated October 31, 2018. with amendments and additions.

During the visit, EEC members established that KRMU has a policy that is officially published on the university's website "Rules for admission to a medical educational institution" and contains the goals, principles, criteria and processes for the selection and admission of students.

The university considers issues that are important in the development of admission policies, such as:

- the ratio between the number of students enrolled (including foreign students) and the existing material, technical and human resources at all stages of education, the available infrastructure to ensure their proper education,

- Observance of the principle of equality and differences in the enrolment of students,

- rules for reapplying, postponing the deadline for admission, and rules for the transfer of students from other educational Programmes, medical schools within the country and from countries near and far abroad.

According to the standard, the university periodically reviews the number and number of students admitted, in consultation with relevant stakeholders, and regulates, in order to meet the health needs of the population and society as a whole, which also considers the recruitment of students based on their gender, ethnic origin and language, and the potential need for a special admission policy for students from low-income families and national minorities.

Selection and admission procedures are governed by national policies, explain how these rules are applied at the local level, also establish their own policies, the selection and admission process, explain their relationship to the stated mission, expected learning outcomes, relevant regulatory requirements, and the local context.

The university has an established student selection process, which includes:

- justification and selection methods, such as secondary school outcomes, other relevant academic experience, entrance examinations and interviews, assessment of motivation to become a doctor, including changes in needs related to the diversity of clinical practice;

- the following criteria for the student selection process should be considered: the requirements for selection, the stages of the student selection process, the mechanisms for admission and confirmation of admission, the mechanisms for filing and receiving complaints. The university has a policy and has introduced the practice of admitting students with disabilities in accordance with the current laws and regulations of the country. The KRMU periodically reviews the reception policy, based on relevant data from the public and the professional community, in order to meet the health needs of the population and society as a whole. An appeals system is used to make a decision.

Training on a contractual basis is carried out by concluding an agreement with the student and paying for training within the terms specified in the agreement.

During the conversation with the staff of the admission commission, it was established that the selection of students takes into account the passing score, the results of the psychometric test, which affect the relationship of mastering the educational Programme and the quality of the graduate. In the current year, the Admission Commission accepted applications for participation in the competition for the award of a state educational grant from graduates of general education schools in 2021 who have passed a unified national test (UNT) and applicants who have passed a comprehensive test, with points for a certificate of at least 70, including at least 7 points in a specialized subject and at least 4 points in other subjects. The main method of selection of applicants for admission was the results of the competition for the award of State educational grants of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. At the same time, according to the results of the psychometric test, there was no refusal to admit applicants. Also, the members of the EEC noted that the dynamics of the number of applicants enrolled in the university indicates a steady increase in the number of applicants during 2019-2021. Thus, 691 students were admitted in 2019, and 830 in 2020. A significant share of applicants is accounted for by foreign students. The admission of students from foreign countries is carried out by the Department of International Cooperation, the rules for admission of foreign students are regulated in the Charter of the University.

The university pursues a policy of balanced enrolment based on gender, ethnicity and other social requirements, including the potential need for a special admission policy for students from poor families. Applicants with disabilities of the first and second groups, children with disabilities, as well as persons with disabilities from childhood, submit to the admission commission a medical opinion on the absence of contraindications for studying in the chosen specialty. When conducting a competition for educational grants in the event of equality of UNT points, persons with disabilities have the priority right. The competition for the award of an educational grant for students with disabilities is held on the basis of approved quotas from the total amount of the state educational order.

#### 4.2 Student Counseling and Support

EEC experts confirmed that the university provides academic, social, and financial support to students, guaranteeing confidentiality. THE university provides career counselling. Students are provided with support in the development of academic skills, as well as assistance to students with disabilities, for unhindered career growth.

The university has a psychologist, works with students, but there is no information about the emergency service for students and teachers.

The university identifies students in need of academic or personal advice.

There is a support service in the educational process: tutors, advisors and mentors, but there is no information about the specific function of each, during the interview students found that they do not find the difference between tutors and advisors, considering them one support service.

Members of the EEC noted that, in addition to the university website, there is a local network – "Moodle", in which a folder "Internal documents of the university" is created, the Internal Regulations, the Charter of the university, the Code of Academic Integrity, Academic Policy, Guidebook, syllabuses and other documents are placed. From interviews with students, it was revealed that, starting from the 1st year, a guidebook is distributed to the group leaders, which is distributed in a cascade method to the entire group. The University has a Career Center, whose duties include informing, advising on career guidance, career planning, and employment.

EEC experts analyzed the document "Regulations on social support of students", according to which students are provided with tuition benefits, a flexible schedule of repayment of tuition fees after the provision of supporting documents in accordance with the criteria approved in the Regulations. The provided privileges are confirmed by orders of the rector and protocols of the commission on social questions.

The student's progress is constantly monitored and data is included in the professional career planning. The university also provided students with documents confirming the qualifications obtained, including the achieved learning results, the content and status of the education received, as well as the completion of studies.

During the interview with students and university management, it was revealed that twice a year the rector of the university meets with students. During these meetings, students have the opportunity to express their opinions and wishes regarding their participation in the decision-making process, academic quality assurance and other professional, financial and social issues.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 16 standards: fully - 14, partially - 2, non-compliant - 0

#### Standard 4: standard is fulfilled

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Consider introducing an emergency psychological service for students and teachers (4.2.)

2) Determine the functional responsibilities of the tutor, advisor and mentor in the educational process and document this (4.2.)

# Standard 5: FACULTY Evidence of compliance:

#### 5.1 Policy on Academic Staffing

During the interview with the management of the university departments and the analysis of the submitted documentation, it was established that the selection of candidates for positions is carried out exclusively on the principles of competitiveness and merit, ensuring equal access of candidates to the relevant positions, taking into account the qualifications, professional indicators, as well as work experience. Competitive selection is carried out on the basis of the current Regulation on the competitive substitution of positions of faculty and researchers (order No. 26-02-44-n/k dated 27.11.2020).

Information on the availability of vacant positions is posted on the university's website and in the media. The criteria for the selection of teaching staff are the presence of an academic or scientific degree, experience in the medical field, at least 5 years, the ability to scientific analysis with the prospect of scientific growth. The competence of personnel when hiring is established on the basis of certificates of education, training, skills and experience (diploma, certificate, certificates of advanced training, CV). For the sake of transparency of the selection processes, the contest is broadcast online on Facebook. As a result of the competitive selection, an employment contract is concluded. The competition for filling positions is held annually, in the 2018-2019 academic year 113 teachers passed the specified competition, in the 2020-2021 academic year more than 200 teachers passed the competitive selection, and in 2020 10 teachers of the departments passed the competitive selection from the position of teacher and assistant to the positions of senior teacher.

The submitted documents contain provisions on the department, the job descriptions of which are familiar to all employees. The heads of departments, the dean of the faculty exercise control over the performance of official duties of teaching staff.

The total number of faculty members is formed on the basis of the average ratio of students and teachers -6:1. The staffing table is approved at the beginning of each school year. At the same time, the distribution of teaching staff by discipline categories directly corresponds to the number of teaching hours approved for each discipline.

The share of full-time teachers of clinical disciplines with medical qualification categories is 44% with the highest category, 5.5% with the first, 1.9% with the second and 48% with a specialist certificate. The total number of full-time teachers of clinical departments is 484.

The University has developed and successfully operates a Personnel Policy, which reflects: the selection and admission of employees, the development and activities of employees, the promotion of employees, etc. The selection and recruitment of employees is carried out in accordance with the established requirements, taking into account basic and vocational education, as well as practical work experience, individual abilities, professional knowledge and other indicators.

Priority is given to candidates with higher qualifications, skills of scientific and pedagogical, scientific, clinical activities, corresponding to the mission of the university. The university attracts highly qualified specialists of medical science and practical health care to carry out high-quality educational activities. University teachers are members of the working groups of the Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, members of the working groups for the preparation of clinical protocols for the diagnosis and treatment of diseases. They are members of the dissertation councils and various Associations, which testifies to the competence and professionalism of employees.

Functional responsibilities, qualification requirements, the scope of responsibility of the faculty in all disciplines are reflected in the Regulations on structural units, as well as in the Job Descriptions. The professional level of the university's teaching staff is maintained and developed in the system of continuous training and advanced training.

From 2018 to 2021, the total number of teaching staff increased by 286 people. Of these, the number of full-time teachers increased by 212 people, doctors of sciences – by 52 people, candidates of sciences – by 178 people. The average age of the TS decreased to -44.5 years.

Teaching was conducted in Kazakh, Russian and English; 82 per cent of teachers taught in Kazakh. There are no restrictions on employment on the basis of sex, race, nationality or language.

The university has a system of motivation for teaching staff, which is determined by the Regulation "On Remuneration" (Decision of the Constitutional Court of 29.11.2017, Minutes No.4). The most effective methods of motivating teachers to improve the quality of teaching and research are the allocation of monetary awards, material assistance to teachers for publications in the most ranked scientific journals and participation in conferences, congresses, congresses, symposia.

The most effective methods of motivating young teachers are special training Programmes for new pedagogical technologies based on other organizations, joint research and organization of publications of young teachers with leading university professors, as well as material funds allocated to young scientists for participation in conferences, advanced training Programmes, etc.

Bonuses are awarded to employees based on the results of work for the academic year, the successful conduct of the admission commission, certification, accreditation, scientific results, for the birthday and anniversary dates. For high scientific and pedagogical indicators, teachers are awarded the academic title of university professor.

In the period from 2015 to 2020, teachers were awarded the academic title of professors of KRMU -7 people and the academic titles of associate professors of KRMU -3 people. In recent years, 28% of the representatives of practical health care have been admitted to the core staff of the university.

In 2020, the contest "Best Teacher of the Theoretical Department", "Best Teacher of the Clinical Department" was held among the teaching staff. According to interviews with teachers, the winners received financial compensation.

The academic mobility Programme of teaching staff has been actively implemented in KRMU since 2014, which makes it possible to acquire and implement international best practices, expand professional, pedagogical and clinical knowledge and skills, discuss, develop and implement project ideas, strengthen the image of the university.

EEC experts noted that the regulatory documents of the university do not provide for differentiation of the teaching load of teachers depending on their activity and the volume of scientific, methodological and clinical work. At some departments, the degree of the teaching staff is below the average level.

#### 5.2 Academic performance and professional ethics of teachers

EEC experts confirmed that academic activity and professional behavior of faculty members are reflected in the University Personnel Policy, the Code of Academic Integrity of Employees. Both documents are available on the University's website. The documents regulate the system of norms and rules that allows to bring the personnel potential in line with the mission and goals of the university, regulate the assessment of work in the field of human resources, regulate the provision of professional and job development, rotation of personnel and their social protection.

The internal regulatory document "Regulation of internal quality assurance of educational activities describes the responsibility of academic staff in teaching, research and clinical activities.

The activities of the faculty and employees of the university are carried out in accordance with the internal labor regulations and job descriptions.

Teachers of the university work with students as advisors. During the interview, students noted the teacher Kitayeva E.Z., who actively helped them to form an individual educational trajectory when choosing elective disciplines. Teacher Saule Shakhatanovna helped freshmen during the adaptation at the University's teaching staff is actively engaged in methodological activities.

According to the submitted documents, over the past period, the teaching staff published 7 textbooks (1 of them in Kazakh, 2 in English), 11 textbooks, 4 monographs, 2 handbooks and methodological recommendations. During the pandemic, the faculty created 500 video lectures. During the survey, students noted that they actively used them and noted the video lectures of the teacher Taufik Nabievich.

#### 5.3 Continuous professional development of academic staff

When analyzing the documents, EEC members found that the principles of equal opportunities for continuous professional development in their careers are reflected in the Charter and Personnel Policy. In order to ensure the proper level of qualification of teaching staff, the "School of the Teacher" operates in the university, there is a system of advanced training and professional development of university staff.

Professional development plans are developed for faculty and administrative staff for each year. Training and development of teaching staff is carried out through short-term seminars, short-term courses and internships in leading universities and medical organizations.

The University organizes English language courses for faculty. As part of the Winter School in 2018, 15 people studied, in 2019 - 49 people, in 2020 - 28 people. In 2018, a number of 140 teachers underwent advanced training on the topic of "Teacher of medical organizations of education and

science". In preparation for the first semester of the 2020-2021 academic year and improving the quality of online teaching, training was provided for faculty in the course "Distance Education Technologies".

561 people were trained (order No. 26-05-02 dated 01.08.2020). As part of the Winter School 2021, 227 employees were trained (order No. 26-02-59-n/k dated 25.12.2020) on the following topics: 1. "Regulatory and legal support of higher and postgraduate education" -45; 2. Communication skills -41; 3. Testology -26; 4. Distance learning technologies-115

From April to June 2021, the university conducts advanced training of faculty in the following modules: Testology, Communication Skills, Distance Education Technologies (Order No. 26-02-18-n/k dated 01.04.2021). In the 2016-2017 academic year, at the expense of the sponsors-partners, English language courses were organized. 8 people were trained, order No. 373 l/s dated 30.12.2016. In the 2017-2018 academic year, the teaching staff was trained in English, the organizer of which was IMU LLP, on a sponsorship basis (order No. 22 l/s dated January 3, 2018, 21 people were trained).

In the 2018-2019 academic year, the Department of International Cooperation and Academic Mobility selected the teaching staff for the level of knowledge of English and concluded a contract for training with individual entrepreneur E.A. Druzhinin "TALENT" (contract No. 25 dated December 6, 2018, 24 people were trained). A contract for the training of an employee of the administrative unitary enterprise with the IE "MARLINPRO" was concluded (No. 00873 dated 02.11.2018, 1 person trained).

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 10 standards: fully -9, partially -1, non-compliant -0

#### Standard 5: standard is fulfilled

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) In regulatory documents, provide for differentiation of the teaching load of teachers depending on the activity and scope of scientific, methodological and clinical work (5.1)

2) Bring the degree of teachers of departments with a low level of this indicator to the average degree at the university (5.1)

# Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

## 6.1 Material and technical basis for teaching and learning

During a visit to higher education institution, it is established that KRMU has 2 educational buildings with a total area of 12,706.4 sq.m., a sports hall, 1 hostel for 200 places.

The total number of undergraduate and internship students in the "General Medicine" is 6297 students, the total area of classrooms is 16462 sq. m, including the area of the classroom fund, sq. m - 8204.6 and the classroom fund - 395 classrooms.

EEC experts got acquainted with the material resources of several departments and the TCC, in particular, the Department of Language Disciplines has a linguistic office with 30 seats, the Department of Chemistry is equipped with a laboratory office, the Department of Anatomy has an anatomical museum equipped with Pirogov's electronic desks, microscopes for studying histological preparations. One of the indicators of improving the material and technical base for strengthening practical skills is the TCC. The center occupies an area of 370 sq. m. There are 10 rooms in the TCC, of which 9 are used for the educational process. Taking into account modern requirements, a hall has been equipped to practice skills in anesthesiology and resuscitation. In addition, the TCC has a separate 2-storey building with an area of 150 sq.m. – "Mini Polyclinic". This unit has a separate entrance, changing room, debriefing room and 6 rooms equipped with the necessary equipment. Training rooms are equipped with educational visual stands, computers, video projectors. A debriefing room is available. In the educational process, mannequins, simulators for mastering certain skills and abilities, high-tech simulators with special computer Programmes for practicing clinical thinking skills are used.

The library of the university is a member of the Association of University Libraries of the Republic of Kazakhstan (2018) and a member of the Association of Medical Libraries of the CIS (2020). The

unified information and library fund at the beginning of the 2020-2021 academic year is 536840 thousand units of storage, taking into account the funds of partner libraries with which Cooperation Agreements have been signed. In the state language – 243804 copies, in Russian – 288924 copies, in foreign – 4112 copies of publications of all types. The library fund meets the qualification requirements for educational activities and the list of documents confirming compliance in accordance with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 17, 2015 No. 391. The Foundation for Educational Literature and Educational and Methodological Literature has 330,721 copies, which is 62.6% of the total amount of the Foundation. Fund of scientific literature – 108280 copies, including in the state language – 58384 copies. The library signed contracts with 20 Kazakhstani and 8 international organizations, libraries and scientific foundations, including the Republican Interuniversity Electronic Library. Students and academic staff have access to modern information resources to support the educational Programme (MEDLINE, EMBASE databases, access to e-books and reference materials, access to electronic journals).

Thus, the management of the university for the continuous improvement of the material and technical base from the university budget allocates the necessary funds, which are spent on: major and current repairs, technical equipment of educational, scientific and information activities.

Every year, the university carries out emergency relief activities in emergency situations. For this purpose, a "tent campus" is being developed in the courtyard of the university, equipped with cartoons to demonstrate the skills of first aid and emergency care, followed by the implementation of these skills by students themselves, under the supervision of the teachers of the TCC and the Department of Emergency and Ambulance. KRMU, one of the first, went to provide medical care to the population in the event of an emergency in the city of Arys and the Dzhambul region.

A safe training environment is ensured by constant monitoring by the security service. The university has video cameras, an access system, fire protection corners, and special yellow stickers on glass doors. The training building and clinical facilities have additional entrance and exit doors in case of emergencies. Ensuring the working environment conditions is carried out in accordance with the accepted sanitary norms and safety rules of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In the training rooms, in the training laboratories, when using the equipment, a "Safety Notice" is posted. All safety information is available on the university's website.

#### **6.2 Resources for Clinical Training**

The list of medical institutions attracting 9,914 beds for 6,297 students as university bases – in 40 medical institutions, which confirms the adequacy of conditions to ensure the mastery of practical skills of students.

In addition, the clinical bases of the university are PHC organizations that provide outpatient and polyclinic care. Number of clinical facilities in the current year -75: hospitals -40, primary health care facilities -52, MC -4, NC, research institutes -9, maternity hospitals -4, TB control organizations -2, PMSP organizations -30, Private MC, LLP -26, Central district hospitals -4, Other medical organizations -3, located in Almaty, Almaty region and 8 regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

There are cooperation agreements with clinical bases, which are drawn up taking into account the needs of the university in the profile of patients and the availability of study rooms, laboratories. In accordance with the terms of the agreements, students have the opportunity to take part in rounds, consultations, medical conferences, attend operations, assist in operations, participate in night shifts, as confirmed in conversations with students.

#### 6.3 Medical research and scientific achievements

According to the Development Strategy of the university, applied research works of faculty departments are implemented, students of the university through temporary scientific teams created for the implementation of research projects.

The University carried out research work on the topic: "Center for the development of primary health care" (Head: Rector, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Dzhainakbayev N.T.; Candidate of Medical Sciences Kassymzhanova Zh.K.). One student participated.

Two students were involved in the research work on the topic: "Scientific-based approaches to improving the process of training middle-level personnel" (Head: Rector, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Dzhainakbayev N.T.). One student took part in the research work on the topic: "Early diagnosis of the retina and optic nerve" (Head: Rector, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Dzhainakbayev N.T., Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor Dzhumataeva Z.A.; Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Mansharipova A.T.).

6 students were involved in the research work on the topic: "Provision of primary health care to the population of the regions of Kazakhstan using mobile medical complexes (MMC)". In addition, research departments are carried out, where students are involved in research work, which is confirmed by the work on the 1st round of the Republican tour.

Students' participation in research is voluntary. However, the website of the university contains information about the availability of scientific clubs or scientific student groups, contact details of the responsible teacher. Participation in the research institute can be proactive, when the student himself shows interest in science and is enrolled in a circle. The winners of the Republican and International Student Scientific and Practical Conferences, Olympiads, competitions are encouraged by the university management.

According to the submitted documentation, scientific achievements during 5 years: the presence of patents and copyright certificates -2, the release of monographs, textbooks, textbooks (3), scientific articles -2016 - 31, 2017 - 33, 2018 - 38, 2019 - 96, 2020 - 54. The university held: 7 international conferences, 9 republican scientific and methodological conferences and seminars, 4 contests of research institutes and 6 seminars. Participation of teaching staff in international symposia and conferences - 56, seminars - 24.

One of the illustrative examples of the introduction of scientific achievements, which is the basis for the educational Programme, is the Department of Oncology and Mammology with a course of visual diagnostics, based in two main oncology institutions in Almaty: the Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology and the Almaty Oncology Center, which provides direct access to the clinical and laboratory units of the institutions, directly to patients and the necessary archival material.

#### **6.4 Information Resources**

During the visit of the EEC, it was established that the total number of computers - 414 pcs., 135 laptops, a well-established document management system of internal documents through the Thesis system and corporate e-mail is functioning. The learning process is automated with the Platonus information system. Situational monitoring is carried out from video surveillance systems in administrative, educational buildings and visual control of the external territory of the university. In each of the university buildings, the connection to the Internet is carried out by fiber-optic cable at a speed of 100 mb/s, with the help of which students, faculty and employees use Internet services in the hall of the electronic library, computer science office, during classes, students have the right to use the Internet if necessary. The corporate WI-FI network provides 100% coverage of educational and administrative buildings. Access to the corporate Wi-Fi network is provided to students and employees of the KRMU registered with the university's corporate network.

To prevent the spread of COVID-19 infection, the educational process at the university in accordance with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 01.04.2020 No. 123 was transferred to a format using remote educational technologies. All students were provided with access to IS Moodle, Platonus and Microsoft Teams (in accordance with the decisions of the Academic Council dated 30.03.2020, Minutes No. 8 and dated 14.08.2020, Minutes No. 0/1). The DLT department was established within the university structure, and a call center was organized. In September 2020, online classrooms for students and faculty were created on the basis of the university. About 300 video lectures were shot in the video studio of the DLT department. The University purchased 10 multimedia devices with training software installed (anatomical table "Pirogov", virtual Histological Atlas, etc.). Multimedia devices are actively used in the educational process at the Departments of Anatomy, Surgery, Obstetrics and Gynecology.

In January 2021, in accordance with the plan for improving the skills of university staff, the annual Winter School -2021 for teaching staff was held, as part of which an online course "Distance educational technologies" was held.

The university purchased an automated library information system "Irbis-64". The Programme has modules "Registration", "Catalogue", "Picking", "Book issue", "Web-catalogue". On the university's website, under the heading "Library", students and faculty have access to an electronic catalogue. Free access to information systems was provided: IPR MEDIA, BookUp, EBSCO Information Services, Wiley Library Services, IVIS, BMJ. EBSCO Information Services, together with the Committee of Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, opened free access for all universities and institutes of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Kazakhstan to 17 full-text scientific databases. Among the Kazakhstani database holders, they were among the first to open access to their databases of KazNU named after Al-Farabi, Nazarbayev University, RNTB, RIEB. Scopus, Elsevir's Science Direct and Web of Science databases were periodically accessed through training webinars, which were sent to teachers and students by the library.

Textbook kits in electronic format were prepared for students from the 1st to the 6th year. The group chiefs provided lists of students and their e-mail addresses for the possibility of sending the requested books.

#### **6.6 Education expertise**

On the basis of the submitted documentation, the experts established that the internal examination of the quality of the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine" is carried out using such criteria as the assessment of the content of the EP, taking into account the key competencies and the final results of training. The data of "feedback" from students, graduates and teachers are analyzed. External expertise of EP is carried out by professional communities and employers.

Internal evaluation is carried out by the Educational Programmes Development Department, which applies procedures for monitoring, evaluation and revision of EPs to ensure that they achieve their objectives and meet the needs of stakeholders. To this end, provision is made for the participation of students, employers and other stakeholders in the evaluation and revision of the EP. The results of these processes are used to improve the EP. Internal examination of EP is carried out twice a year, taking into account the opinions of students, teachers and employers.

In the documentation for the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine" there are 4 reviews from external reviewers. Also, the EP undergoes external review when placed in the register of the EP.

#### 6.6 Exchange in education

The university is a member of many European associations such as AMEE and WFME. The Department of International Cooperation and Academic Mobility is working to establish extensive ties with Kazakh and foreign universities.

Students and undergraduates who have studied within the framework of academic mobility Programmes (exchange and two-degree study Programmes) and have mastered credits are re-calculated credits and disciplines in accordance with the approved curriculum of the university educational Programme.

Since the 2014 academic year, the University has signed about 30 international agreements with medical universities and organizations of the Republic of Belarus, Greece, Israel, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan, Russia and Turkey in the field of medical education and science, academic and cultural exchange of faculty and students.

In December 2020, a Mandate was signed for participation in the EU grant Programme "Erasmus+" consisting of a consortium of European, Azerbaijani, Kazakhstani and Russian universities, medical organizations and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan with the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the creation of an educational Programme.

The University implements and implements scientific research together with domestic and foreign partners: the National Center for Occupational Health and Diseases, Kazakhstan; Research Institute of

Radiation Medicine and Ecology of Kazakhstan, Research Institute of Surgery of Kazakhstan; foreign universities: First Moscow State Medical University named after I. Sechenov; Altai State Medical University; Omsk State Medical University.

Within the framework of signed contracts and memoranda for international internships, employees and students of the university are selected on a competitive basis.

Also, 53 students of different levels and specialties from international universities were successfully accepted for internships.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with* 21 standards: fully -19, partially - 2, not compliant - 0.

#### Standard 6: I standard is fulfilled

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) For the efforts of scientific, educational activities and academic mobility, expand the geography of universities of partners from the countries participating in the Bologna process (6.6.).

# Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION

# **Evidence of compliance:**

# 7.1 Quality Assurance System

During the visit to the university, the members of the EEC determined that on the basis of the approved normative and legal acts, a quality assurance system was introduced in the KRMU, which covers the educational, administrative and research areas of the school. The quality assurance system has approved normative and legal acts that regulate the mission, vision and policy in the organization of education in the specialty "General Medicine".

The "Academic Policy" (SC No.1 dated August 27, 2021) describes the processes of the University's personnel training activities, including ethical standards, for both students and teachers, this regulatory document includes: 1. General provisions; 2. Rules for admission to training; 3. The procedure for carrying out activities; 4. Assessment and monitoring of student performance; 5. Academic mobility; 6. Rules for the transfer of students; 7. Expulsion of students; 8. Provision of academic leave; 9. Recovery from academic leave; 10. State scholarships; 11. Tuition fees; 12. Student support services; 13. Quality control of the educational process; 14. Responsibility.

The approved document on quality policy (SC No.1 dated 27.08.2021) has a plan for the academic year, in all areas, including international cooperation.

To ensure quality, the university has a department for "Management and quality control of education", this department within the structure of the institution has reporting to the rector and vice-rector for academic disciplines. The approved document Regulation on the Quality Management System Department – signed by the Vice-Rector for Strategic Development – on December 29, 2018 – contains the general statement, functional responsibilities of the department and activities of the department, reporting and accountability of the department.

The functions and qualifications of the head of the management system department were approved by the vice-rector on December 29, 2018, and on the same date the document on the functions and qualifications of the chief specialist of the department was approved, the document contains - the general situation, functional duties and activities of the head and employees of the department, the work plan, material incentives, responsibility, etc.

At the same time, the university has an electronic turnover of documentation and information, that is, to confirm the document – management of documented information at the university, approved by the rector of the university on 30.12.2019 – requirements for the types of documentation for registration, development and turnover in all structural units of the university.

#### 7.2 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms of the programme

During the visit, the members of the EEC established that the university development strategy, the work plan of the QMS department included measures to study and analyze the activities of the relevant departments of the university, there are protocols, study reports, as well as recommendations for improving the activities of councils and departments. The activities carried out by the Department of Management and the Department of Quality Control were also confirmed in conversations and interviews with students and teachers of the university.

To ensure quality at the university, there are several documents according to which the educational Programme is carried out, including: - the main components of the educational Programme, which include the model, structure, content, duration and use of the mandatory and elective parts of the Programme (see Standard 2: Educational Programme)

- the student's academic progress;

- identification and consideration of problems in the achievement of students' expected learning outcomes through the collection of information about them;

– use of feedback for the development of corrective action plans and measures to improve the educational Programme, including: "Academic Policy", approved at the meeting of the SC No.1 of August 27, 2021, "Code of Academic Integrity", approved at the meeting of the Academic Council of the protocol - No.9, dated April 27, 2019, the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine" – approved by the decision of the SC and the Rector of the University - No.0/3 of October 15, 2020, the Catalog of Elective Disciplines for 2021-2022 approved at the meeting of the Academic Council No.4 – of February 25, 2021, all of the above documents in 3 languages.

At the same time, there are a lot of sub-normative documents, that is, norms and rules of admission, the process of education, current, midterm control, final examinations, rules of test control and the possibility of retaking, educational and clinical training, scientific achievements of students; privileges provided for students with social support, etc., which are annually approved.

According to the submitted documents, in order to achieve the set requirements, the annual plans of tasks for the educational Programme hold meetings of the councils, with the involvement of employers and the commission includes students.

#### 7.3 Teacher and Student Feedback

On the basis of the submitted documents, it was established that questionnaire surveys are conducted to assess and analyze the quality management of the educational Programme. These questionnaire surveys are conducted online, after each discipline. Experts studied questionnaires for questionnaires for teachers, for students, for employers, and also presented the results of the questionnaire in the form of diagrams.

The study of regulatory documents on the management of the quality management system, as well as face-to-face meetings with faculty and students, confirm the existence of monitoring of the educational Programme, but in further developed action plans and in the work of academic councils, the inclusion of the results and recommendations of this work is not observed.

#### 7.4 Academic achievements of students and graduates

In 2019-2020, 2020-2021 academic years, training was conducted in a remote mode. In view of this, the practical studies were transferred to the Moodle learning platform where educational materials both for practical studies and for students' independent work under supervision of an instructor (SIWSI / SROP) and student's independent work (SIW / SRO) had been uploaded, formative and summative assessment was provided in an electronic gradebook. Interim and final certifications were carried out via the Platonus and Microsoft Teams platforms using video proctoring.

The effectiveness of the mission and goals of the educational programme (EP) in General Medicine is systematically evaluated at meetings of the departments, the Committee of Educational Programmes (CEP), the Faculty Council, the Methodological Council ("Akademicheskiy sovet") and the Academic Council ("Uchenyy sovet") through a planned study of the results of student academic performance, the preparation for the state exam, the level of student satisfaction with the learning conditions. The results of student progress allow for drawing conclusions about the achievement of the learning outcomes which are indicated in the syllabi of course units.

Preparation for the educational programme in General Medicine takes into account baseline and professional competencies. Student performance analysis includes direct assessment of student and graduate performance, results and achievements in student research and clinical practice. One of the criteria for evaluating the effectiveness of the EP in General Medicine is the indicators of the final certification of graduates.

According to the submitted documents, the EEC members stated that, in concordance with the results of the independent state final certification of interns of the educational programme in General Medicine, over the past 3 years, there had been a tendency to increase the average score from 88.5% (in 2018-2019) to 92.8%. In 2020-2021, out of 314 students who were allowed to pass the final state certification, 313 students (99.7%) successfully passed it, while 72 graduates (23.0%) passed it with honours, the remaining 241 persons passed the certification with good grades, and 1 intern performed unsatisfactory.

Also, the EEC became familiarized with the results of the final state certification of graduates of the bachelor's degree programme in General Medicine over the past 5 years. Over 5 years, the average score ranged from 80.2% to 86.4%. For 5 years, out of 827 students, only 3 performed unsatisfactory. The students who passed the certification with good grades prevailed (65.4%), those who passed it with honours made up 27.5%, and 7.0% of students performed satisfactory.

EEC experts analysed the examination results of 1st-5th year students during winter and summer examination periods for the last 3 years. On average, the absolute student performance of the faculty ranges from 89% to 94% and the qualitative rate ranges from 70.8% to 91.9%. During the last analysed examination period of 2021-2022, out of 2892 students of 1st-5th years at the faculty, 212 persons (7.3%) did not conform to the examination eligibility criteria, 16 (0.6%) out of 2685 students, who were allowed to pass, were absent at the examination. 89 students (3.3%) performed unsatisfactory. More than half of students (58.4%) obtained excellent and good grades, and 13.3% persons passed it with honours.

Thus, EEC members noted a good level of competence among graduates of bachelor's degree programme and internship of the Faculty of General Medicine according to the results of the independent final state certification, as well as generally positive dynamics of passing the examination periods from the 1st to 5th years of study. At the same time, the main indicators of passing the examination periods have remained consistently high for 3 years.

Evaluation of achievements in students' research work is carried out at specialized departments under the guidance of an instructor, at clinical sites. Some of students published articles based on the results of the research work, presented the research papers at conferences. These achievements had been reflected in students' portfolios in the form of copies of printed works and certificates of conference participants, as well as diplomas and other awards, which was confirmed by EEC members during a selective inspection of the students' portfolios.

Also, one of the indicators of academic achievements is the analysis of the employment of graduates. According to the submitted documentation, in 2021, out of 227 students under the state funding, 157 persons were employed, thus the share of employed graduates of the General Medicine direction was 69.1%, while the share of those who had arrived at the place of employment was 97%.

In addition, in order to analyse the educational achievements of students and graduates, questionnaires are conducted after passing each discipline. The questionnaires include questions on the analysis of students' educational achievements in relation to their previous experience, level of training (qualification) at the time of admission to medical school. Also, this aspect was confirmed in the study of the document titled Regulations on the Admissions Committee. According to the programme of the EEC visit, on April 18, 2022, a meeting with the Executive Secretary of the Admissions Committee G.B. Kaliyeva, Deputy Executive Secretary of the Admissions Committee Zh.A. Lyan was held. The meeting established that the annual student admission took into account the level of students' preparation before entering the university.

Thus, EEC experts confirmed that the monitoring of planned activities within the framework of the implementation and evaluation of the educational programme was carried out at meetings of the department, the Faculty Council, the CEP, the Methodological Council. During the meetings, the implementation of plans is checked; compliance of the results with the planned indicators is studied; performance and progress are discussed; corrective actions are developed if necessary. The results of the final state certification, interim certification are announced regularly at the meetings of the department, the Faculty Council, and conclusions are drawn about the expected achievability of the learning outcomes of graduates. If necessary, adjustments are made to the syllabi, the list of references is supplemented, an order for the purchase of literature is made, contracts with new clinical sites are drawn up.

#### 7.5 Stakeholder Engagement

During the analysis of the documentation and the site visit to the university, EEC members found that the participation of stakeholders in the evaluation and improvement of the EP in General Medicine is provided both by the authorized bodies in education and health, and by members of public, professional organisations, as well as university employees, students and employers. For instance, an independent assessment of the knowledge of graduates is carried out by the commission of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Representatives of public associations, societies and other professional associations organise research and practical conferences on topical issues of medical education and specialty. With the help of members of the public, feedback is provided by means of questionnaires and interviews, participation in various events held by the KRMU.

All stakeholders (academic teaching staff, students, employers) are involved in the evaluation process of the EP through representation in the relevant structures. The work of all structures that ensure the implementation and evaluation of the EP is regulated by the Charter of the university, the development strategy of the university, annual plans and reports of departments, as well as the relevant QMS procedures. The results of the evaluation are heard at meetings of the dean's office, the Committee for Educational Programmes (CEP), the Methodological Council (MC), the Academic Council (AC), and are published on the website of the university.

Representatives of students are members of the Dean's Council, CEP, MC and AC, where they participate in discussing the implementation of educational programme.

The university has a wide network of clinical sites, contracts have been concluded with 74 healthcare and research institutions which provide not only for the educational activities of students at clinical sites and practice bases, but also provide for the medical activities of the faculty of the university, as well as the participation of practical healthcare physicians in the educational process including the evaluation of the EP through participation in various advisory bodies of the university. With the help of employers, a system has been created to promote the employment and adaptation of graduates; the analysis of the quality of training of university graduates is carried out, feedback from practitioners on the results of students' professional practice is collected, and issues requiring mutual participation of representatives of the university and practical healthcare are submitted for discussion.

Annually, the demand of practical health care for professionals is taken into account on the basis of requests from health care departments which are accumulated by the KSMU Career Centre, then they are submitted to the dean's office and discussed with the specialised departments.

Every year, the Career Centre conducts a survey of employers, job fairs, organises visits of employers in order to attract young professionals to the regions, taking into account local, national and global conditions, evaluates the level of satisfaction of employers with university graduates to identify the compliance of the EP with the relevant requirements of the labour market, opportunities for its improvement, as well as the level of compliance of the competencies of students and graduates with positions in the workplace. The results of the surveys allow for making changes to the educational programme, opinions of employers on the quality of student training are considered. Annually, based on the results of discussions with employers, the catalogue of elective subjects is updated. Representatives of practical health care are involved as chairs, members of the commission and examiners during the

independent final certification of interns, as well as state exams in the bachelor's degree programme, they take an active part in the distribution and employment of graduates of the KRMU. Opinions, comments and recommendations of employers and other stakeholders are taken into account when planning changes and improving the EP.

EEC members confirmed the active participation of stakeholders in monitoring and improving the educational process of the EP in General Medicine. For example, the Committee for Educational Programmes approves the members of the Committee each year, there are more than 4 groups, and each group has employers and students and alumni. During the site visit of the EEC, at the meeting with the Head of the Educational and Methodological Department and Deputy Chair of the Methodological Council Sh.O. Uysenbayeva, Head of the Department for Academic Work B.A. Bakirova, Chair of the Committee for the Educational Programme in General Medicine D.N. Alybayeva, Secretary of the Academic Council A.T. Mansharipova, EEC members also received confirmation of this area of activity of the university. Also, in the course of the conversation with employers, EEC members received information that the employers had participated in Council meetings and suggested their recommendations when the educational programme had been discussed.

Adjustments to test assignments or clinical examination stations are also carried following the recommendations of the State Attestation Commissions (SAC) and analysis of the feedback from students and employers. Thus, based on the submitted documents, according to the recommendation of the SAC in the 2018-2019 academic year, the following subjects and clinical skills were included in the second stage of the Objective Structured Clinical Examination (OSCE): emergency medicine - Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation; surgical diseases - Initial Surgical Debridement; internal (medical) diseases - Anaphylaxis; obstetrics and gynaecology - Management of the Third Stage of Labour; childhood diseases - Rickets in Children; traumatology - Application of Transport Immobilization in Injuries.

In order to ensure the transparency and objectivity of the clinical examination, representatives of practical healthcare were included in the examination commission: L.I. Nurgaliyeva, MD, PhD of MedSc, obstetrician-gynaecologist of the superior expert category, City Polyclinic No. 34; S.A. Nurgaliyeva, obstetrician-gynaecologist of the superior expert category, City Polyclinic No. 11; A.A. Nurbekova, MD, DMedSc, Associate Professor of the Department of Endocrinology, National Medical University; N.Sh. Bozhbanbayeva, MD, DMedSc, Associate Professor of the Department of Neonatology, National Medical University; V.Zh. Kudabayeva, primary care physician of the first expert category of the emergency hospital; L.Zh. Ospanova, M.S., primary care physician of the first expert category of the emergency hospital; I.N. Ibragimova, MD, PhD of MedSc, Associate Professor, Head of the Residency Course at the Scientific Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases; A.A. Sarmasayeva, MD, PhD of MedSc, general practitioner of the City Clinical Hospital No. 4; G.M. Dyusekeyeva, general practitioner of the first expert category of the Scientific Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases; G.R. Tuleobayeva, general practitioner of the superior expert category of the City Clinical Hospital No. 7; A.Sh. Zhumasheva, general practitioner of the superior expert category of the Polyclinic of the Department of Internal Affairs; A.L. Kim, general practitioner of the superior expert category of the Scientific Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases; G.K. Salmenbayeva, MD, PhD of MedSc, surgeon of the superior expert category of the Central City Clinical Hospital; D.K. Zhamashev, MD, PhD of MedSc, trauma orthopaedist and combustiologist of the superior expert category of the Hospital for Emergency Medical Care; N.N. Isayev, M.S., trauma orthopaedist and combustiologist of the first expert category of the Centre for Children's Emergency Medical Care.

The QMS Department also works to determine the satisfaction of internal and external stakeholders of the university. The index of student satisfaction with the conditions of training in the EP in General Medicine is 72% in total. A questionnaire was developed to assess the effectiveness of the administrative divisions of KRMU. A survey of the heads of departments and other structural subdivisions was carried out. The feedback results are analysed and discussed at the meetings of the

quality department, departments, CEP, MC, AC. Also, these issues are addressed at the annual meetings between the rector and the faculty of the departments and students.

Thus, EEC members confirmed that in order to improve the educational programme the university evaluates and revises the EP in General Medicine and engages students, faculty and other stakeholders in the process. Stakeholders, both internal and external, are members of collegiate bodies and participate in the discussion of programmes; feedback from students and educators, graduates and employers is also systematically analysed. Based on the results of the feedback analysis, measures are developed to improve the quality and effectiveness of the educational programme. The feedback received is one of the grounds for making changes and additions to the educational programme.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant from* 15 standards: fully -13, partially -1, non-compliant - 0

#### Standard 7: standard is fulfilled

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) For the effective management of the educational Programme, it is more active to use indicators of the quality management system (7.2).

### Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION Evidence of compliance:

#### 8.1 Management

When studying the submitted documentation, it was established that the KRMU has its own structure of management, clinical training, research activities and resource allocation, which is transparent and accessible to all stakeholders, consistent with the mission and functions of the school, and ensures its institutional stability. This document was approved by the Rector's order dated 16.07.2020 and includes all structural units and advisory and consultative bodies. The activities of each unit are regulated by the Regulation.

The university has developed and approved the mission, vision and policy of its activities.

Guarantees of transparency of the management system and decisions made are enshrined in the "Academic Policy" (SC No.1 dated August 27, 2021), "Code of Academic Integrity" (SC No.9, dated April 27, 2019), as well as in a number of regulatory documents on the organization and conduct of the education process, which are posted on the website, included in the protocols for review and implementation.

The university has defined the tasks and functions of the Academic Council, where all regulatory acts of the university are discussed and approved. Functions of councils on academic activity, scientific and educational activity of university are also defined.

The next link in the assessment of the quality of the educational Programme is the CEP, which monitor and analyze the effectiveness of the EP developed by the departments.

In accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, KRMU has autonomy in the framework of selection and placement of personnel, implementation of educational, educational and methodological, clinical, scientific, financial and economic activities

The top management annually analyzes the organizational structure of the university in order to update it, if the need for organizational changes arises, the development of a project of a new organizational structure is initiated.

EEC experts confirmed that the university in its management structure has a number of collegial bodies dealing with advisory and consultative issues - a scientific council, an academic council, committees of educational Programmes, a scientific and clinical council, a coordination council on quality and strategic development and councils of faculties, while the composition of all collegial bodies includes students who have equal rights.

During the visit, an interview with various stakeholders of the educational process, it was established that the system of its management is carried out through discussions and consideration of issues at collegial bodies, and the decisions made are approved and recorded in the minutes of the meeting. Members of collegial bodies and responsible persons in the supervised areas participate in the discussion of issues.

To ensure open discussion of problems and ideas for training students, the Rector's blog https://medkrmu.kz/blog-rektora/ is available on the official website. The Marketing and Public Relations Department posts up-to-date information on the official website for public review and information.

According to the submitted documentation, the CEP includes teaching staff, administrative staff, employers and students. The main activities of the CEP: development, discussion, approval, monitoring and evaluation of EP, organization of methodological support of the educational process and professional practice. According to the approved structure, CEP report to the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs.

The members of the EEC established that the structural unit responsible for risk management is the QMS department, the regulatory body for risk management is the internal audit service, which assesses the effectiveness of the risk management system at the university, assesses the effectiveness of the application of risk management procedures and risk assessment methodology. All structural subdivisions of the university also manage and monitor risks within the framework of their functional responsibilities, while the QMS department has the right to demand from the structural subdivisions the documents and information necessary for the implementation of their functions

#### 8.2 Representation of students and academic staff

EEC experts confirm that the EP content is regularly reviewed taking into account national and regional conditions based on the results of feedback from representatives of employers, teachers, students and other stakeholders. Annually, according to the results of the discussion, the catalogue of elective disciplines is updated, the Career Center conducts questionnaires of employers, job fairs, visits of employers in order to attract young specialists to the regions.

Analysis of academic achievements of students studying in the field of general medicine is provided by feedback from the dean's office, office-registrator. After the semester, the results of the examination session are heard at the meetings of the departments, the meeting of the CEP on General Medicine, the Academic Committee, the Academic Council, with the preparation of the SWOT analysis and the identification of areas for improvement, which is confirmed by the protocols of the relevant departments and the information presented in the annual reports.

During the interview with students, it was confirmed that there are several student organizations in the university – the student council, the SSS, the council of young scientists, existing on the principles of student self-government, the administration of the university and the teaching staff are interested in contributing to the creation and functioning of such student communities.

#### 8.3 Administration

During the visit, the EEC members were convinced that the administration of the university and the management of the Faculty of General Medicine in particular support the teaching staff and employees of structural units in their operational work in the form of various functions: the possibility of direct participation in the development, optimization and improvement of administrative management; organization of the process of search and attraction of teaching staff on a competitive basis; inclusion in all collegial bodies; assistance in social policy issues; ensuring the confidentiality of personal files of teaching staff; the possibility of improving the qualifications and presentation of data of their scientific activities at the expense of the university, providing visa support to teaching staff traveling under academic mobility Programmes.

#### 8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

According to the presented structure of the university, financial issues are under the responsibility of the Director of the Department of Financial Work and the Chief Accountant, whose duties are reflected in the job descriptions and in the Regulations on the Department of Financial Work.

During the interview with representatives of this department it was established that the formation of the budget for the new academic year is carried out by the planning and economic department, which is part of the department of financial work. In order to implement the principles of efficiency, priority, transparency, and independence of all levels of budgets, a budget commission is created before the beginning of each academic year.

The budget of the Faculty of General Medicine is formed from two sources: the state order for the training of university and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, the development of scientific research, transfers and the provision of paid educational services.

Every year, before the beginning of the academic year, the departments and the dean's office prepare budget applications, which reflect all the applications planned for the academic year in accordance with their strategic plan. After consideration and approval by the Budget Commission of the applications of each department and faculty as a whole, the budget of the entire university is formed and resources are allocated in accordance with their needs.

The teaching staff of the General Medicine Faculty is the main resource for ensuring the stated mission, and the share of salary costs for teaching staff is the main one in the budget.

The calculation of salaries of full-time teaching staff is made taking into account the academic load, the position held, pedagogical experience, academic degree, academic title. The calculation of the salary of external part-time employees is made taking into account the educational load performed (no more than 0.5 of the rate), the position held and the pedagogical experience. There is a system of allowances for TS. The salaries of employees are set at the basic official salary, based on the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 31.12.2015. No.1193 "On the system of remuneration for civil servants, employees of organizations maintained at the expense of the state budget, employees of state-owned enterprises", taking into account changes dated 12.08.2021.

Judging by the submitted documentation, in comparison with the 2017-2018 academic year, in 2021-2022 there is a twofold increase in the salary of all positions of teaching staff. Expenditure on acquisition of fixed assets also has a steady upward trend.

#### 8.5 Interaction with the health sector

During the study of the submitted documents, the General Medicine Faculty cooperates with leading clinics and healthcare organizations and concluded contracts with 85 clinical bases at the beginning of the 2021-2022 academic year. According to the agreements on cooperation, the implementation of medical and consulting work of faculty departments is carried out in the form of: consultations and rounds; patient management; participation in the work of medical consultations; participation in ongoing activities on the organization of the medical process and other functions necessary for the proper organization of medical and educational processes.

The submitted documents confirm that the teaching staff of "General Medicine" participate in consultations, conduct master classes, are members of the working groups of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the development of standard Programmes, clinical protocols.

The main areas of joint activity of the faculty "General Medicine" with clinical bases were determined by the following types of activities: implementation of educational curricula of higher medical education, retraining and advanced training of healthcare workers; organization and implementation of events on scientific and information exchange, conducting research work; provision of qualified medical care to the population in the profile of departments of the "General Medicine".

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant from* 17 standards: fully -15, partially -2, non-compliant - 0

#### Standard 8: standard is fulfilled

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Involve in the work of the student council and the center of youth policy representatives of the students of the foreign faculty (8.2).

#### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

During the visit to the university and the analysis of the submitted documentation, the EEC members confirmed that the Quality Policy and Objectives are updated annually in the KRMU, semiannual and annual reports of all structural units are maintained. An integrated quality management system has been implemented. Internal assessment of the quality of education is carried out by a selfassessment procedure for undergoing a specialized accreditation procedure. The results of the selfassessment are used to address deficiencies, as well as in the development of strategy, quality policy and review of educational functions.

The organizational structure of the university is reviewed annually in accordance with the ongoing reform in the field of education and health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan, changes in the practice of world educational management. In different years, new structural units were created and added, the functional tasks of which are aimed at ensuring the quality of educational Programmes.

The activities of the university are regulated by documented procedures developed in accordance with ISO 9001, as well as documents that are necessary for the effective planning, implementation and management of processes. Records management is carried out in accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 703 "Rules for documenting, document management and the use of electronic document management systems in state and non-state organizations".

In order to create conditions for continuous improvement of activities at the EP, a system of strategic management (project-oriented/matrix structure of management of the faculty activities and assessment of efficiency and effectiveness – "Mission – vision – strategy – planning – deployment of plans – implementation of plans – measurement of results – management") is applied, a SWOT analysis tool is used.

The heads of the departments are responsible for improving the activities of the department, reviews and annually updates the normative and legal acts for the department. According to the plan, the entire faculty of the department undergoes advanced training in the specialty and in pedagogy with the introduction into the educational process.

After the accreditation at the meeting of the Academic Council of the University, the comments and recommendations of the members of the external expert commission on the improvement of educational Programmes are analyzed, a plan of corrective actions is drawn up, those responsible for the implementation of the plan measures are appointed.

Certification of current student performance, final certification, certification of all types of practice, verification of the methodological support of the educational process, collection and analysis of data on customer satisfaction, internal audits are used as internal university control.

Methods for assessing students' competencies are constantly reviewed. For example, a few years ago, taking into account feedback from employers, a mini-clinical examination was introduced, which improved the quality of practical skills; work is under way to increase the list of clinical bases.

In order to create a favorable and effective learning environment for students at the university, feedback is monitored annually in accordance with the Procedure for conducting customer satisfaction assessment through a questionnaire. The results of the survey are analyzed at meetings of structural units, the Academic Council and the Academic Council.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 3 standards: fully -3, partially -0, non-compliant -0

Standard 9: standard is fulfilled Recomme ndations for improvement identified during the external visit: no

# 6. Recommendations for improving the bachelor's degree programme "General Medicine", developed during the study of the self-assessment report and the external evaluation:

- 1. Activate the process of submitting applications to the competition commissions of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and other granting organizations for grant and Programme-targeted financing of research projects of teaching staff with the inclusion of young scientists and students (2.4.2, 2.5.3).
- 2. Using the results of the analysis of the demand for content, determine effective types of training based on remote technologies for their subsequent use in the educational process (2.8.2).
- 3. In the Catalog of Elective Disciplines, disciplines for foreign students should be provided, taking into account the peculiarities of their national health care system (2.7.1).
- 4. Implement automated psychometric analysis of test tasks using software (3.4.1).
- 5. Consider introducing an emergency psychological service for students and teachers (4.2.3)
- 6. Determine the functional responsibilities of the tutor, advisor and mentor in the educational process and document this (4.2.6)
- 7. In regulatory documents, provide for differentiation of the teaching load of teachers depending on the activity and scope of scientific, methodological and clinical work (5.1.2)
- 8. Bring the degree of teachers of departments with a low level of this indicator to the average degree at the university (5.1.2)
- 9. For the efforts of scientific, educational activities and academic mobility, expand the geography of universities of partners from the countries participating in the Bologna process (6.6.).
- 10. For the effective management of the educational Programme, it is more active to use indicators of the quality management system (7.2.4).
- 11. Involve in the work of the student council and the center of youth policy representatives of the students of the foreign faculty (8.2.4).

# 7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC established the compliance of the educational programme "General medicine" with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

	FULL NAME
Chairperson	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich
Foreign Expert	Ubaidullaeva Sevara Abdullaevna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Mustafina Kamila Kamalovna
Employers' representative	Shamsutdinova Alfiya Gumarovna
Student Representative	Kadyrova Aynur Adiletovna

A

ECAQA Observer M.A. Umarova

# Attachment 1.

	(generalization)	70	Es	timatio	n
Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	11	10	1	
2	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	38	33	5	
3	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	14	13	1	
4	STUDENTS	16	14	2	
5	FACULTY	10	9	1	
6	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	19	2	
7	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	14	13	1	
8	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	17	15	2	
9	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	3	3	0	
	Total:	144	129	15	
				144	

Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme (generalization)

# Attachment 2.

# The list of documents studied by the members of the EEC as part of the specialized accreditation of the "General Medicine"

№	Names of documents	Quantity	Date of approval
1.	Academic Policy	1	27.08.2021
2.	Acts of implementation in the educational process	11	2018-2021
3.	Analysis of the questionnaire of 1st year students on	1	2020-2021
	adaptation to the conditions of academic activity		
4.	Feedback questionnaire on the assessment of student	1	
	satisfaction with work at the university		
5.	Extract from the Minutes No.5 of the Academic	1	26.12.2019
	Council on the discussion and approval of the		
	mission of the KRMU		10.00.0001
6.	Annual plan of the Department of General Medical Practice for 2021-2022	1	18.08.2021
7.	Annual report of the Department of General Medical	1	24.07.2021
/.	Practice for 2020-2021	1	24.07.2021
8.	Contracts with clinical bases, list of clinical bases	76	2019-2021
<u>9.</u>	Job descriptions of teaching staff	8	24.09.2021
10.	Personnel policy	1	25.12.2020
11.	Code of Academic Integrity	1	27.04.2019
12.	Teacher Honor Code	1	12.12.2017
13.	Concept of educational work	1	27.08.2021
14.	CED general medicine (5 years) for 2021-2022	1	25.02.2021
15.	CED general medicine (internship) for 2021-2022	1	25.02.2021
16.	Educational Programme "General Medicine"	1	15.10.2020
	Bachelor's degree		
17.	Educational Programme "General medicine"	1	30.03.2020
	internship		
18.	Scorecards	9	2021-2022
19.	Employer Survey Report	1	2020-2021
20.	CYS and SSS work plan for 2021-2022	1	14.09.2021
21.	Work plan of the educational and methodological department for 2021-2022	1	26.09.2021
22.	Plan of educational work for 2021-2022	1	24.09.2021
23.	Plan of meetings of the CEP "General Medicine" for	1	26.09.2021
25.	2021-2022	1	20.09.2021
24.	Regulations on the Academic Council	1	06.12.2021
25.	Regulations on the Academic Council	1	20.09.2019
26.	Regulation on DLT	1	18.03.2020
27.	Regulations on the Commission for ensuring the	1	26.08.2021
	academic quality of the educational Programme	1	20.00.2021
28.	Regulations on the Committee for Educational	1	06.12.2021
Programmes			
29.	Regulations on competitive filling of positions of	1	27.11.2020
30.	teaching staff and researchers Regulations on the contest "Best University Teacher"		
50.	of KRMU	1	27.08.2021

31.	Regulations on the current monitoring of academic performance, interim and final certification of students	1	29.08.2019
32.	Regulations on CYS and SSS	1	24.09.2021
33.	Regulation on the Board of Curators	1	18.11.2019
34.	Regulations on social support for students	1	21.06.2019
35.	Regulations on the Student Council	1	18.11.2019
36.	Regulation on the Test Committee	1	28.10.2021
37.	Regulations on the Teacher's School	1	26.11.2021
38.	Academic Mobility Regulation	1	27.08.2021
39.	Regulations on the Organization of Training with the	1	
57.	Use of Distance Education Technologies	1	29.08.2019
40.	QMS Regulation	1	29.12.2018
41.	Regulation on the assessment of students' knowledge	1	29.08.2019
42.	Quality Policy	1	27.08.2021
43.	Portfolio of interns	8	2021-2022
44.	Rules of Internal Regulations for Students	1	29.08.2019
45.	Rules for using the "Anti-plagiarism. University"		
15.	system	1	29.08.2019
46.	Rules for Granting Academic Leave to Students	1	29.08.2019
47.	Rules of admission to the university	1	24.07.2020
48.	Order No. 26-02-64 on the appointment of curators	1	31.08.2021
10.	for 1-7 courses of GM	•	51100.2021
49.	Order No. 26-02-95 on the provision of discounts on	1	24.11.2021
	tuition fees in 2021-2022	-	
50.	Order on approval of the composition of the	2	26.08.2019
	Academic Council No.213 with amendments dated		
51	09.12.2019	1	20.09.2010
51.	Order on approval of the composition of the Academic Council	1	29.08.2019
52.	Order on the appointment of the Organizational	1	29.12.2021
	Structure of the Test Committee		
53.	Order on approval of the composition of the final	1	29.10.2021
	certification commission in 2021-2022.		
54.	Order on the appointment of advisors for 2022-2023.	1	29.12.2021
55.	Disciplinary Commission Order	1	25.04.2021
56.	Adaptation Programme for freshmen students to study at KRMU	1	
57.	Minutes of the Commission meeting on the provision	1	16.11.2021
	of discounts on tuition fees in 2021-2022		10.11.2021
58.	Minutes of the round table and employment fair	1	23.04.2021
59.	Minutes of the round table and employment tan Minutes of the meeting of the AC on the results of	1	22.10.2020
	the questionnaire of students of the 1st year on	-	10.2020
	adaptation		
60.	Minutes of CYS and SSS meetings in 2021-2022	4	10.09.2021,
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	-	14.09.2021,
			14.03.2022,
			05.04.2022

61.	Minutes of meetings of the Board of Directors, the	9	june 2019
	Board of Directors, the CEP, departments for		0
	discussion of the EP and the EP mission		
62.	Reviews for EP General Medicine	6	
63.	EEC for 2021-2022 "General Medicine"	1	18.08.2021
64.	Certificates of higher-education teaching personnel	12	2017-2022
	for advanced pedagogical training		
65.	Syllabus by discipline: childhood diseases, infectious	4	27.08.2021
	diseases, general medical practice, pediatric surgery		
66.	Situational clinical challenges	30	
67.	List of reports of students to scientific conferences,	25	2018-2022
	competitions, certificates, diplomas, diplomas		
68.	List of TS publications in Web of Science, Scopus	5	2017-2022
	for 5 years		
69.	List of students with disabilities for 3 years	3	2021-2022
70.	List of Student Council Members	1	2021-2022
71.	Strategy of the NEI KRMU for 2019 – 2025	1	26.12.2019
72.	Structure of KRMU	1	16.07.2020
73.	Learning journals (electronic)	6	
74.	Samples of measuring instruments with reviews	12	2020-2022
	(examination cards, tasks, tests, etc.)		
75.	Examination vouchers	5	2020-2022

Table 1 - Information on the num	er and category	of participants	in meetings,	interviews,
interviews with EEC members				

N⁰	Full name	Job Title	
1.	Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich	Rector	
2.	Seidalin Arystan Askarovich	acting Vice-Rector for Scientific and Clinical Work	
3.	Kusainova Arman Sailavbekovna	Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs	
4.	Tatyana Anatolyevna Sovostyanova	Acting Vice-Rector for Academic Work	
5.	Iskakova Maryam Kozbaevna	bachelor's Dean	
6.	Abdukarimovsh Hashim Khakimovich	dean of Internship	
7.	Uysenbayeva Sharbanu Omirgaliyevna		
8.	Bakirova Bibigul Abdimanapovna	Head of Academic Affairs	
9.	Alybaeva Dinara Nurgalievna	chairperson of the Committee of the Educational Programme "General Medicine"	
10.	Mansharipova Almagul Toleuovna	secretary of the Academic Council	
11.	Kulebayeva Elmira Kuanyshevna	head of the Career Center	
12.	Kalieva Gulbanu Batyrkhanovna	Head of the Registrar's Office and Executive Secretary of the Admission Committee	
13.	Alexander Viktorovich Vodovtsev	Head of the Department of Distance Education Technology (DLT)	
14.	Manapova Damira Edigeevna	Head of test center	
14.	Aumoldaeva Zaure Maratovna	head of the Training and Clinical Center	
16.	Merkeeva Madina Ivanovna	Chairperson of the Center for Youth Policy, Head of the Video Recording Studio	
17.	Valiulina Marzhan Bekarystanovna	Head of Library	
18.	Sinkov Dmitry Valerievich	Gymnasium Manager	
19.	Iskakova Dana Askarovna	head of the Department of International	
		Cooperation and Academic Mobility	
20.	Ermekbay Kanagat Alimzhanuly	chief Specialist of the Department of International Cooperation and Academic Mobility	
21.	Vera Ivanovna Verovkina	head of Personnel Department	
22.	Zhunusova Ainur Zhanalievna	responsible for the Teacher's School	
23.	Mansharipova Alma Toleuovna	Academic Secretary	
24.	Salimgereeva Bagdat Zhanabaevna	Head of the Department of Anatomy	
25.	Erementaeva Zhannym Mukhtarovna	Lecturer, Department of Anatomy	
26.	Esirgepova Sofia Richardovna	Head of the Department of Pathological Anatomy and Forensic Medicine	
27.	Nugmanova Aigul Maratovna	Head of the Department of Pediatrics with a course of children's infectious diseases	
28.	Kondyzbaeva Margarita Mukhammetkaliyevna	Teacher of the TCC	
29.	Marzhan Makhmutovna Lepesova	Head of the Department of Neurology	
30.	Marat Adilkhanovich	Head of the Pediatric Surgery Course	
31.	Ligai Zoya Nikolaevna	Head of the Department of General Practice	
32.	Medeubekov Ulugbek Shalkharovich	Chief Physician, Central City Clinical Hospital No.12	

33.	Manas Yembergenovich Ramazanov	Chief Physician City Hospital No.7
34.	Lyazzat Tasbulatovna Eralieva	Deputy Director of NSC Phthisiopulmonology
35.	Zhumataeva Zarina Akhmetovna	Director, "Rakhat" Medical Center
36.	Yegizekov Almat Lesovich	Medical Director Meditera Medical Center
30.	Baimakhanov Bolat Bimendievich	Director of the NRCS named after Syzganov
38.	Assen Aigul Assenovna	Chief Physician City Polyclinic No.7
39.	Akmira Mukhanbetkaliyevna	Chief Physician City Polyclinic No.29
57.	Sadykova	Chief Thysician City Torychine 1(0.2)
40.	Olzhayev Sayakhat Taurbekovich	Chief Physician Almaty Regional
		Multidisciplinary Clinic
41.	Nurbanu Rolan Mamyrovich	Chief Physician Almaty Regional Children's
		Clinical Hospital
42.	Khaylenko Yuri Aleksandrovich	graduated from KRMU in 1998.
43.	Aumoldaeva Zaure Maratovna	graduated from KRMU in 2010
44.	Tamenova Zhanel Zhanatbekovna	graduated from KRMU in 2015
45.	Lakhanov Nurgali Ualikhanovich	graduated from KRMU in 2016
46.	Tamenov Ishanbek Zholdasbekuly	graduated from KRMU in 2016
47.	Kerimkulov Nursultan Sagyntayuly	graduated from KRMU in 2016
48.	Ayupov Rasul Adilovich	graduated from KRMU in 2016
49.	Saken Baymbetov	graduated from KRMU in 2016
50.	Dmitrenko Maria Sergeevna	graduate of KRMU 2019
51.	Nuralbaeva Perizat	graduate of KRMU 2019
52.	Myasnenkova Galina Alekseevna	graduated from KRMU in 1998.
53.	Tursun Anna Olegovna	graduated from KRMU in 2016
54.	Karagubenova Elminura	chairperson of the Student Scientific Society,
		member of the Student Council
55.	Camilla Aznabakiyeva;	student council member
56.	Abilkasymova Altyn	student council member
57.	Eskaliev Erles	student council member
58.	Kurmanova Akmaral	student council member
59.	Tarasyukov Alexander	student council member
60.	Kiryanova Milana	student council member
61.	Bilkasym Tungyshbay	student council member
62.	Zhumagaliyev Adai	student council member
63.	Asan Jazirah	1st year student GM
64.	Abdullaev Abdullam	1st year student GM
65.	Redchenko Tatyana Malihambatay Eldas	1st year student GM
66. 67.	Makhambetov Eldos Malik Denmark	1st year student GM
67. 68.	Mark Denmark Meiramov Medeu	1st year student GM 1st year student GM
<u> </u>	Timur Takzhanov	1st year student GM
70.	Sabirov Arkken	2nd year student GM
70.	Eskaliev Erles	2nd year student GM 2nd year student GM
72.	Tokan Madina	2nd year student GM 2nd year student GM
73.	Umirbekova Merei	2nd year student GM 2nd year student GM
74.	Darkenbay Damir	2nd year student GM 2nd year student GM
75.	Bilkasym Tungyshbay	2nd year student GM
76.	Nurgaliuly Baktygerei	2nd year student GM 2nd year student GM
77.	Smiley Baibek	2nd year student GM
78.	Amanbay Aida	2nd year student GM

79.	Beckebay Azamat	2nd year student GM
80.	Yakupova Sevara	2nd year student GM
81.	Gaisina Zarina	2nd year student GM
82.	Nurlan Ulzhay	2nd year student GM
83.	Kim Elena	2nd year student GM
84.	Ismailova Ikram	2nd year student GM
85.	Zelinskaya Olga	2nd year student GM
86.	Kusmanova Olga	2nd year student GM
87.	Lee Amin	2nd year student GM
88.	Khusainova Tanita	2nd year student GM
89.	Chekushchin Karim	2nd year student GM
90.	Kapizayev Bagdat	2nd year student GM
91.	Abilkasymova Altyn	2nd year student GM
92.	Zhuanganova Eisere	2nd year student GM
93.	Potapova Marina	3rd year student GM
94.	Belochenko Viktor	3rd year student GM
95.	Iminzhanova Louise	3rd year student GM
96.	Kormanuli Daulet	3rd year student GM
97.	Tukhanova Alina	3rd year student GM
98.	Cizorin Cyril	3rd year student GM
99.	Astafieva Maria	4th year student GM
100.	Aliev Ramil	4th year student GM
101.	Kurmanova Akmaral	4th year student GM
102.	Temirkhanova Zaida	5th year student GM
103.	Zhumagaliyev Adai	5th year student GM
104.	Kurumbayeva Karina	5th year student GM
105.	Ershora Eibek	5th year student GM
106.	Nurmukhambet Elaman	5th year student GM
107.	Gypsy Pavel	5th year student GM
108.	Togzhanov Bakhtiyar	6th year student GM
109.	Sutbaeva Razia	6th year student GM